

CHAUTAUQUA COUNTY

Coordinated Transportation Plan



**Creatively Working Together to Best Fulfill Individual Needs
and Improve Future Efficiency and Sustainability**



Created by: Mark R Geise Mobility Coordinator Intern

Reviewed by: Mark R Geise Deputy Director of the Department of Planning and Economic Development 8/1/2012

Updated by: Jennifer Blair Mobility Manager of Chautauqua County

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	1-2
Introduction	3-9
Plan Methodology: How did we get to this point?	10-11
Federal and County Policies	12-13
Key Stakeholders / Subcommittees	14-21
Inventory of Services and Resources	22
Demographic Analysis	23-29
Need/Gap Analysis	30-32
Proposed Mobility Program	33-34
Major Goals and Strategies	35-46
Expected Benefits	47
Conclusion	48

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Executive Summary / Introduction

The Chautauqua County Transportation Coalition is headed by Mobility Manager Jennifer Blair and made up of representatives from various transportation providers and human service agencies in Chautauqua County...

In accordance with the Section 5310 Elderly Individuals and Individuals with Disabilities Program, the Section 5316 Jobs Access and Reverse Commute Program, and the Section 5317 New Freedom Program, the Chautauqua County Transportation Coalition has developed the Chautauqua County Coordinated Transportation Plan to coordinate transportation providers, to improve services to senior, disabled, low-income, and employable citizens.

Update 2021:

In 2015 Mobility Management was adopted under Section 5311 Non Urbanized Area Formula Grant under operation. Mobility Management is the approach to design and deliver transportation services that start and ends with the customer. It begins with a community vision in which the entire transportation network – public transit agencies, private operators, bicycling and walking, volunteer drivers, drivers and others – work together with customers, planners and Key Stakeholders to deliver the transportation options that best meet the community's needs. Mobility Management encourages innovation and flexibility to reach the right fit solution for customer's plans for sustainability.

In accordance with the Section 5311 the goals of the non-urbanized formula program are:

- To enhance the access of people in these areas to health care, shopping, education, employment, public services, and recreation.
- To assist in maintenance, development, improvement, and use of public transportation systems in rural and small urban areas.
- To encourage and facilitate the most efficient use of all Federal funds used to provide passenger transportation in non-urbanized areas through the coordination of programs and services. To assist in development and support of intercity bus transportation.
- To provide for the participation of private transportation providers in non-urbanized transportation to the maximum extent feasible.

PURPOSE

1. To improve transportation accessibility for all residents, specifically service to seniors, the disabled, the low-income, and employable.
2. To coordinate the needs of transportation providers, human service agencies, and local employers.
3. To provide transportation services at the lowest cost for the population in Chautauqua County.

Objectives:

1. Formulate one resource for all transportation information in the county
2. Eliminate/reduce duplication of services
3. Share costs and services to reduce expenditures
4. Provide travel training for people in need of this service

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

STRATEGIES

- Establish a one-stop call and/or click center for all Chautauqua County transportation information. A person would call a single number and, based on his or her eligibility, special needs, location, and when he or she wants to travel, the operator would refer the person to the transportation provider(s) that is(are) able to serve him or her.
- Create a travel training curriculum to educate the local human service agencies on Chautauqua County's public transit.
- Determine the needs of Chautauqua County residents particularly seniors, the disabled, low-income, and employable persons and create a travel training program / workshops to fulfill these needs.
- Create a community of local transportation providers and Stakeholders that have a vested interest in transportation that will meet monthly to identify areas of duplication and work to reduce and ideally eliminate it.
- Investigate the viability of fleet management software that can satisfy the needs of multiple transportation providers in the county

BENEFITS

With these strategies in place, Chautauqua County transportation providers will:

- Provide better service at a lower cost to Chautauqua County.
- Decrease vehicle needs, and emissions in Chautauqua County.
- Improve communication between riders and agencies
- Allow for easier access to employment for low-income residents
- Provide seniors and disabled residents with more options to reach necessary services
- Rely less on local taxpayer dollars
- Be more efficient in providing the same level of service

These efforts will result in an improved quality life for all residents of Chautauqua County. If low-income residents are able to access job training and employment, this segment of the population will have more spending power to patronize local businesses and will rely less on government assistance. A better trained workforce should make it more attractive for businesses to set up shop in Chautauqua County. More transportation access for senior and disabled residents of Chautauqua County will allow more of this segment of the population in Chautauqua County to access necessary services and take additional shopping and social trips to improve quality of life. More efficient transportation providers should require less taxpayer assistance and be more sustainable. A coordinated transportation system with open lines of communication will be able to adjust quickly to changes and adopt innovative solutions to problems. Ideally, the coordination practices of the transportation providers of Chautauqua County will invoke similar efforts in other disciplines, which should pass on similar benefits to the area's residents.

This will be a continually updated plan in which the latest strategies and projects are explained in detail. It is important to the Chautauqua County Transportation Coalition to keep the public, all government agencies, human service organizations, and local employers updated on what this group is working toward. Transportation is intertwined with all other services in the county, so this needs to be a transparent and collaborative process.

INTRODUCTION

WHY DO WE NEED A COORDINATED TRANSPORTATION PLAN?

Chautauqua County has a rapidly aging population and below average income levels compared to the rest of New York State and the United States.

Did you know?

- Nearly 23% of this county's residents are over 60 years old, compared to 19% of New York State's population and 19.1% of the United States' population.
- In Chautauqua County, households earn an average of \$50,823 with a median of \$40,639. In the United States, average annual household income is \$68,914 (median of \$50,221); in New York State, average annual household income is \$78,947 (median of \$54,649).
- In 2000, transportation costs accounted for 36 cents out of every dollar spent in the poorest fifth of American households, 98% of which was spend on purchasing, operating, and maintaining their cars. (According to the National Association for State Community Services Programs' 2008 issue brief entitled "The Stranded Poor: Recognizing the Importance of Public Transportation for Low-Income Households")

With this information, it is essential for Chautauqua County to provide affordable, quality transportation for the aging and low-income populations without placing any increased burdens on taxpayers. We have a commitment to our aging population to help to provide a sensible standard of living. This population needs access to reliable transportation to reach medical and other services, so we must provide it at a reasonable cost to taxpayers. If transportation services are able to assist these populations to reach quality jobs, employment-related training, medical appointments, and daily activities, thereby aiding to increase income opportunities, some of these problems can be alleviated.



INTRODUCTION

Chautauqua County currently has eight transportation providers, both private and public. With this many providers among a population as small as Chautauqua County's, duplication and over-service of certain areas is inevitable. With a plan in place to consolidate and share the resources of these providers, this duplication can be minimized.

These increases in efficiency will result in financial savings, which will allow for transportation providers to reallocate these savings to:

- cover more geographic area
- look into the option of offering more flexible service times
- provide higher quality overall service and maintenance

Update 2021:

Transportation planning is crucial because it serves in the area of economically, socially, and improves the quality of life for the residents of Chautauqua County.

INTRODUCTION WHO IS INVOLVED?

Chautauqua Area Regional Transit System (CARTS) and Chautauqua Works / Workforce Investment Board are the lead agencies in this coordination project. The following agencies have agreed to coordinate together to work toward this project's goals: The Resource Center, TEAM Services, the Office for the Aging, the Chautauqua Adult Day Care Center, the Veterans Service Agency, Chautauqua County Department of Social Services, SUNY Fredonia, and the Retired and Senior Volunteer Program.



Update 2021:

The lead agencies of Chautauqua County Area Regional Transit Systems (CARTS) and Chautauqua Works / Workforce Investment Board Inc. with shared use of the Chautauqua County Mobility Manager will continue to coordinate to work towards project goals.

The following agencies have agreed to coordinate their efforts to work towards current project goals and develop future project goals that meet the need of the community.

All Star EMS, Erie 2 BOCES, Chautauqua County Department of Public Works, Chautauqua County Health and Human Services, Chautauqua County Office for the Aging, Chautauqua County Veterans Service Agency, Chautauqua Adult Day Services, Career Systems Development, Chautauqua Institution, Community Foundations, Heritage Ministries, Jamestown Community Learning Council, Jamestown Community College, Lutheran Social Services, New York State Office of Temporary Disability Assistance, Southwestern Independent Living Center, The Chautauqua Center, The Resource Center, TEAM Services Inc., SUNY Fredonia, United Way, and Warner Place.

INTRODUCTION

WHAT ARE THE MAJOR GOALS?

Broadly, the overarching goals in this project are to improve transportation for seniors, the disabled, low income residents and the employable populations of Chautauqua County and to coordinate the needs, decisions, and actions by local transportation providers, human service agencies, and employers. To reach these broad goals, we plan to:

- Formulate one resource for all transportation information in the county
- Eliminate/reduce duplication of services
- Share services and costs to reduce expenditures
- Provide travel training for people in need of this service
- Provide travel training for service providers in need of this service
- Introduce innovative new programs and/or add to existing ones to supplement the services currently offered

Update 2021:

The Mobility Manager will assure the goals developed in this working document continue to be met and will be updated as needed. New goals for program year 2021 will be developed and worked on with a new Needs / Gaps List completed by the Key Stakeholders Committee at the April 2021 meeting. Once developed and approved additions will be made to plan

HOW WILL WE REACH THESE GOALS?

Committees

A Mobility Key Stakeholder Committee as well as three more in-depth subcommittees: the Resource Optimization Subcommittee (under this sub committee is the Collaboration Working Group), the One-Stop Call/Click Center Subcommittee, and the Transportation Accessibility Subcommittee will aid in addressing the purpose and objectives of the Coordinated Transportation Plan. Members of the Mobility Key Stakeholders Committee have volunteered for the subcommittees based on their respective expertise and the impact that aspect of the Coordinated Transportation Plan would have on their respective agencies. Each subcommittee will focus on reaching several goals, and reporting back to the Mobility Key Stakeholder committee with its progress.

Update 2021:

Subcommittees will be developed as a need arises in any transportation area. The Mobility Manager will begin a new subcommittee when there is a gap in service that needs to be filled.

Duplication

We have compiled a list of providers, days and hours of operation, number of vehicles, and funding sources. There are multiple strategies to alleviate duplication of services. First, representatives from agencies can meet and identify specific areas and routes where duplication may be occurring. This is the first step Chautauqua County will take to consolidate routes and reduce duplication. Another future step is to aggregate all route, schedule, and eligibility information in one location. One way to do this is to overlay routes from all providers on the County's geographic information system (GIS). We will then analyze this mapping information along with other relevant schedule and eligibility information. We will use this information and evaluate the needs of individual customers to conceive innovative solutions to duplication and over-service.

INTRODUCTION

Depending on how this process moves along, it may be realistic for the County to submit its transportation information to 511.org. 511.org allows for users to search for the available public transportation options when using the site free of charge. Once all the GIS data is completed it can be added to 511.org a free site to find a route / provider for transportation. 511.org is a practical option for rural areas like Chautauqua County to transmit transportation information to its residents.

Update 2021:

As of 2020 the GIS data has been handed into New York State Department of Transportation. This data will be entered on the 511.org website. Currently 511.org is in the testing phase.



Fleet Management / Chautauqua Area Regional Transit System (CARTS)

CARTS have been approved for Section 5311 funding to purchase fleet management software and GPS hardware. This technology allows for transportation providers to track their drivers in real time. Some transportation providers in the county offer a call-in service to be picked up and transported. Currently, when that happens, dispatchers use mapping technology on their computers and must communicate via two-way radio to drivers who they believe are close to the pickup site. With this technology, these inefficiencies would be alleviated; the dispatchers would be able to see the exact location of every vehicle in their fleet.

With this technology, transportation providers would be able to run reports on individual drivers or groups of drivers to identify where operations need improvement. Providers can replay routes to give concrete evidence regarding any customer or driver disputes. Clocking in and out for drivers can be done electronically rather than manually, as their time clock can start at the instant their vehicle begins to move.

Chautauqua County transportation providers will explore the realistic possibility of buying fleet management technology together. This consolidation would allow for each provider to view where all the vehicles in its fleet, as well as all the others, are located and the routes they have taken. This would enable the providers and other interested parties to see where duplication and over-service consistently occur more efficiently and likely more effectively than human analysis. This software also should increase the efficiency of each provider's services, as the technology is able to monitor things and perform tasks that are impossible or time-consuming for human employees to perform.

INTRODUCTION

Update 2021:

In March of 2016 through Section 5311 funding fleet management software was initiated from Route Match Software Company. As mentioned about, this technology enables real time management in the entire CARTS fleet, meaning location of each vehicle in real time and the use of paper manifests is eliminated (unless technology is down). This software also allows customized reports to identify gaps in services.

2018 CARTS applied for the Modernization Enhancement Program Grant (MEP Grant).

Utilizing the 2018 Accelerated Transportation Capital Grant – and part of the 2019 Accelerated Transportation Capital Grant (ACT Grant) Chautauqua Area Regional Transit System purchased a Bus Hub / Junction for centralized transfers and waiting area for buses / people. The Bus Hub / Junction was purchased in 2020. In 2021 the Bus Hub / Junction will be renovated utilizing 2019 and 2020 ACT Grant funding.

February of 2020 CARTS was awarded the MEP Grant. The following updates to Chautauqua County Area Regional Transit System will be funded from this grant. Notification Software (funded by the 5311 grant), and a Mobile Phone application will be completed by 2021 By 2022 CARTS will begin using a cashless fare application.

One-Stop Center

Currently, Chautauqua County does not have one place where people can go (physically, via telephone, or via the Internet) to access all transportation information. This alone can be a deterrent for people to utilize public transportation. If information is not easily accessible, many people will not go the extra mile to find that information. They also may continue to patronize a provider that does not best satisfy their needs. There are several models for physical and/or web-based one-stop centers.

We aim to compile information together to create / utilize an existing website and/or integrate with an existing call-in service. United Way established a one-stop call center in Chautauqua County several years ago, but it was shut down in 2010 because it was not cost-effective due to low call volume. Due to this history, it is most realistic to attach a one-stop call center to existing services. The Chautauqua Area Regional Transit Office is currently being evaluated to see if it is possible to house the call center. CARTS operates in Chautauqua County and already has an existing website / dispatch center, the team is currently looking into expanding the service to create a call-in center for citizens to obtain information and get connected to county transportation services within an already existing agency. United Way also operates a 211 telephone service for the Western New York region out of the Olmstead Center for Sight in Buffalo. Either of those services may be able to absorb Chautauqua County transportation information to become a one-stop call center. This would reduce or even eliminate startup, marketing, and staffing costs.

Update 2021:

2021 Mobility Manager will begin working on a webpage based off the Chautauqua County public transportation site. The webpage will be created by the Mobility Manager and have information included but not limited to: description of services provided by Mobility Management, Key Stakeholders Committee meeting dates, times and meeting minutes, most current needs / gaps list of

INTRODUCTION

Chautauqua County, Inventory of services / transportation providers times of operation and cost if possible. Chautauqua County Coordinated Transportation Plan and Travel Training details.

Travel Training Program

Currently we have surveyed targeted segments of low-income, seniors, disabled, and employable residents, to learn why more people in these populations have not accessed transportation services. Survey results indicated they were unaware of the services, unable to read schedules, afraid to ride, do not know how to ride utilize public transit, and utilize friends or family for transportation. It is our goal to utilize the above data and create workshops to educate the residents of Chautauqua County on the barriers of using public transit.

Update 2021:

In March 2012 the beginning stages to creating a travel training program were set in place. Surveys were sent to local human services agencies to determine what needs of the public and community were in developing a travel training program. In 2013 a public transit awareness presentation was completed at the surrounding County's non assisted living facilities. A soft launch of TRAIN the TRAINER on Travel Training was developed and implemented until the funding source changed from JARC / New Freedom formula grants, the FTA incorporated Mobility Management into the 5311 Rural Program Consolidation Grant in 2015. This grant continues to fund Mobility Management to this day. Travel Training is offered in any form a person in Chautauqua County may need. It may be done by workshop format, information format, and education of systems format or live travel training of individuals or small groups riding the public bus.

Volunteer Driver Program

In a rural county, a public transit system cannot fulfill every need if it wishes to be efficient and cost-effective. To serve more needs without expending the resources of a public transit program, a volunteer driver program is a great alternative. Many models exist, but we envision a program in which those without special transportation needs (they are able to ride in a passenger motor vehicle without assistance), encompassing senior citizens and others without access to their own transportation, are serviced. There is an existing volunteer driver program, but it is very limited in its scope. The program as of March 2021 "employs" only one single volunteer, so there is a limit on how many rides can be provided. Also, it only provides rides to out-of-county medical appointments, with preference given to seniors. In the new program, public transit would focus on fixed route service and serving riders with disabilities and other special needs that would not be able to be fulfilled by a volunteer driver. This program would focus on transporting clients that are not along fixed route services and that do not possess special transportation needs.

In the new program we envision, volunteers would drive their own cars at the beginning; these volunteers would be recruited and given times to be "on-call". They would be reimbursed for mileage, as they are now. We would explore ways to potentially compensate these volunteers to attract more to the program; possibilities include a small stipend for long-term drivers, public transit credit, or credit to use for future use in the volunteer driver program. Credit for public transit and/or for future use in the volunteer driver program would be aimed at the aged 50 and up residents in the region. Residents from this age group are more likely nearing the end of their working years and have or will soon have more spare time to give back to the community, while also planning for their future needs. Donating time to the volunteer driver program would achieve both objectives; volunteers would give back to members of the community and will have a transportation option to fall back on if and when they

INTRODUCTION

cannot or will not operate their own motor vehicle anymore. Fares charged would be comparable to the currently available transportation options (public transit door-to-door and curb-to-curb service). This program would also explore accepting trade-ins of vehicles to be used within the program. If seniors have determined that they cannot drive anymore, they can trade in their vehicle for above market value to this program in exchange for credit to use within the program and/or on public transit. This would allow for the program to attract volunteers who may not have access to their own vehicles or would prefer not to use their own vehicles in the program.

Update 2021:

The volunteer drivers program will be a goal that will be revisited in 2021 with the Key Stakeholder Committee.

Rideshare Program

A rideshare program can consist of a combination of carpools and vanpools. The members of both carpools and vanpools live in close proximity to one another, work close to one another, and have comparable work schedules. In both types of ridesharing, commuters come together to save money, reduce their impact on the environment, and share the stress of driving. *Carpools* form when people come together and share space in a personal vehicle to travel to and from work. The members of the group may alternate who drives if each member has access to his or her own vehicle, or one member may drive every day while the others contribute to gas costs. *Vanpools* are essentially large carpools that utilize a rented or leased van with high capacity, rather than a personal automobile. Vanpools consist of groups of around 6 to 15 people. Each member contributes a share of leasing, gas, and maintenance costs. The drivers, who must be certified to operate the vehicle, may pay a lesser share or nothing at all in exchange for driving and maintaining the vehicle.

Much like the volunteer driver program, a rideshare program would give transportation-challenged residents another alternative to public transportation. However, rather than provide periodic rides to access services and social activities, a rideshare program would give residents another option to get to work and employment-related training and activities. With Chautauqua County's proximity to Erie County and the City of Buffalo as well as, to a lesser extent, Erie, PA, there is a need to transport citizens to bigger cities for work. As of now, Coach USA offers routes to Erie and Buffalo from Chautauqua County, but these are limited by both time and pickup locations.

The best centrally operated rideshare program would have multiple facets. The County would likely run or oversee a rideshare website and promote this website to both employers and residents. Carpools would then emerge from this service as residents discover the website and employers promote the benefits of carpooling to their employees. The County also would need to discover whether there is local demand for vanpools. If it is a viable option, there are several ways in which vanpooling could be integrated into the transportation system. The County itself could purchase vans to market to the public or contract with a third-party operator like Enterprise. A private company already has the infrastructure and proven methods in place to succeed, so this would likely be the most realistic option for Chautauqua County. The County can use its connections and power to persuade employers and market to residents, while the private company would handle the fundamentals of vanpooling.

Update 2021:

The volunteer drivers program will be a goal that will be revisited in 2021 with the Key Stakeholder Committee.

PLAN METHODOLOGY

HOW DID WE GET TO THIS POINT?

Initial Stakeholders Meeting

This process commenced with an initial stakeholders meeting involving political decision makers, local human service agencies, local public transportation providers, private and non-profit agencies, and state agencies. The lead agencies, Chautauqua Area Regional Transit System (CARTS) and Chautauqua Works, were identified out of this meeting. Key stakeholders were also identified out of this meeting; representatives from the agencies in this group make up the Mobility Stakeholders Committee as well as the more focused Resource Optimization, One Stop Call Center and Transportation Accessibility Subcommittees. Based on research of other comparable areas and their approaches to coordinate transportation systems, we identified these subcommittee foci as some major facets of an efficient and effective transportation system.

A multitude of agencies have agreed to coordinate together in this process. These include CARTS, The Resource Center, TEAM Services, Chautauqua Works, and the Chautauqua County Office for the Aging, the Chautauqua Adult Day Care Center, the Veterans Service Agency, Chautauqua County Department of Social Services, SUNY Fredonia, Aspire of WNY, the Retired and Senior Volunteer Program, Joint Neighborhood Projects, and Veterans Service Agency. These agencies have active presences in the Mobility Stakeholder committee, the three subcommittees, and are involved in this process in other various ways.

Demographic Analysis

We analyzed data from the U.S. Census Bureau to determine the need for an enhanced mobility program. Through this analysis, we found that Chautauqua County has an aging and poor population when compared to the rest of the state and nation. At the same time, the population of the county and its two cities are declining. More vulnerable segments of the population, such as seniors and low-income residents, are most likely to use public transit, but decreasing population leads to less demand from the less vulnerable portions of the population. This predicament necessitates a need for quality, efficient public transportation; we must cut costs while maintaining sufficient levels of service to meet the individual needs of Chautauqua County residents.

Inventory of Services and Resources

We compiled an inventory of current transportation services and resources in Chautauqua County. We identified eight transportation providers and then collected such relevant data as days and hours of operation, clientele, number of annual trips, number of vehicles, ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act) accessibility, funding sources, and whether the provider is funded privately or publicly.

Need/Gap Analysis

This information was then used to conduct a need/gap analysis to determine where the current transportation services are lacking or need improvement. We identified twenty potential needs to address with mobility management strategies.

Stakeholders Survey

We then distributed a survey to the Mobility Stakeholders Committee to determine what members believed were the most realistic and priority needs to alleviate. Based on their responses, we have most voraciously pursued the highest priority and most realistic needs.

Case Studies

In addition to internal investigation and surveying, we have researched numerous other mobility management strategies and initiatives from other similar counties throughout the country. Case studies have been relevant to multiple steps to this process; this information was used in part to identify the most important topics for subcommittees to focus on, the needs and gaps in the County's existing services, and to serve as a guide for this new and innovative mobility management process in Chautauqua County. It is extremely important to discover what has already proven to be successful to keep this process on course and to provide evidence for the decisions we make.

FEDERAL AND COUNTY POLICIES

Forces at the federal and county level have influenced the direction of this coordinated transportation effort. New legislation, visions for the future, and increases in particular types of funding have helped to shape where we have reached in this process.

FEDERAL LEVEL

The Safe, Accountable, Flexible, Efficient Transportation Equity Act: A Legacy for Users (SAFETEA-LU) was signed into law on August 10, 2005, by President George W. Bush. This act guaranteed \$244.1 billion for highways, highway safety, and public transportation. SAFETEA-LU aims to improve transportation services for persons with disabilities, older Americans, and individuals with lower incomes.

This act requires all Federal Transit Administration (FTA) programs for underserved populations to establish a "locally developed, coordinated public transit-human services transportation plan." This plan should identify the transportation needs of individuals with disabilities, the elderly, and people with low incomes, provide strategies to meet these needs locally, and prioritize these transportation needs for funding and implementation. Communities must coordinate transportation resources provided through multiple federal programs. A coordinated plan for human services transportation should enhance transportation access, minimize duplication of services, and encourage the most cost-effective transportation possible. Many levels of coordination in this process are possible. Sharing rides, vehicles, and funding are the most obvious; however, other needs exist that are applicative to coordination, such as sharing maintenance, training, listing services, information technology, and intelligent transportation systems.

The programs for these underserved populations are funded through the Elderly Individuals and Individuals with Disabilities program (Section 5310), the Job Access and Reverse Commute program (Section 5316), and the New Freedom Program (Section 5317).

Elderly Individuals and Individuals with Disabilities Program (Section 5310)

This Federal Transit Authority (FTA) program funds public transportation capital projects planned, designed, and carried out to meet the special transportation needs of elderly individuals and individuals with disabilities.

Jobs Access and Reverse Commute Program (Section 5316)

This Federal Transit Authority (FTA) program funds projects to develop and maintain transportation services designed to transport welfare recipients and other eligible low-income individuals to and from employment and employment-related training and activities. This program also funds public transportation projects designed to transport residents of urbanized and non-urbanized areas to suburban employment opportunities.

New Freedom Program (Section 5317)

This Federal Transit Authority (FTA) grant program funds new public transportation services and public transportation alternatives beyond those required by the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990. These new services and alternatives assist individuals with disabilities with transportation, including transportation to and from jobs and employment-related training and opportunities.

FEDERAL AND COUNTY POLICIES

Rural Program Consolidation Grant (Section 5311)

This Federal Transit Authority (FTA) grant program funds public transportation in areas with populations of less than 50,000 people. The funding formula is based on the non-urbanized population and land area of the states.

Several updates to the application have occurred since the 2013-2014 cycle and are outlined below:

- a. Revised maximum project duration to recognize timing of federal grant approval process and State contract execution process.
- b. Supportive Employment Services (SES). This is a new category and reflects the consolidation of federal section 5316 (JARC) funding into rural and urban formula programs under MAP-21. Operating Assistance for existing JARC funding has been “grandfathered” into the SES column in Tab 9. All Applicants can also apply for new operating assistance SES projects. Include operating expenses as part of the regular budget and note the percentage of expenses attributable to SES.
- c. Fare Table to provide additional information on fare products used.
- d. Mobility Management Request Form. Now part of 5311 program and eligible for up to 80% federal funding.
- e. In-Kind Valuation Form which may be used with Mobility Management Request
- f. Appalachian Development Public Transportation Assistance Program (ADPTAP) this is a new funding program under MAP-21 for operating, capital and planning assistance in 14 eligible counties. See Tab 9 for funding details.
- g. New fleet and facility inventory form.

COUNTY LEVEL

The Chautauqua County Department of Planning and Economic Development recently released its 20/20 Comprehensive Plan. This comprehensive plan states, as one of its many goals, to "improve coordination and cost benefit results of community services and infrastructure investment." More specifically, the plan for the future aspires toward increases in public transit ridership and elimination of service duplication by bringing public and private transportation providers and human service agencies together. The plan calls for continued sufficient access to adequate health care for all Chautauqua County residents. Also targeted in detail is Chautauqua County's workforce; workers need to be educated, well-trained, and appealing to businesses to promote economic development and success in the County.

Throughout this plan, there are several common themes. **Coordination, quality service, and focus on individual residents** are three that are relevant to this planning process. The County as a whole has recognized that, to remain viable in the future and to continue to fulfill the individualized needs of residents, we must coordinate, consolidate, and not be afraid to think innovatively. As a rural community, Chautauqua County has many assets to offer, most importantly its people. The individual needs of residents must always be at the forefront of decisions, as these residents are the county's greatest and most essential resources. We must continue to provide quality transportation to necessary medical services and affordable transportation to employment and employment-related training and services to support Chautauqua County's realistic and exciting goals for the future.

Lead Agencies

REGION AFFECTED

Chautauqua County

LEAD AGENCIES

Chautauqua Works, Inc.
Chautauqua Area Regional Transit System (CARTS)

CONTACT PERSONS

NAME	Jennifer Blair	Michele Westphal
AGENCY	Chautauqua Works	CARTS
MAILING ADDRESS	234 Hopkins Avenue Jamestown, NY, 14701	234 Hopkins Avenue Jamestown, NY, 14701
PHONE	716-661-8492	716-661-8486
FAX	716-661-8470	716-661-8470
E-MAIL	jblair@chautauquaworks.com	westpham@co.chautauqua.ny.us

We **foster coordination** among transportation providers to **eliminate duplication of services** and pursue **innovative approaches** in order to maintain current levels of service while improving **efficiency**, adding additional and **higher quality** services across more geographical area, and fulfilling more individualized needs. Transportation services are an important component of life for many Chautauqua County residents, so we work to ensure the **long-term viability** of these services.



Involved Agencies

Update 2021 with all involved agencies *CC = Chautauqua County

CARTS Public Transportation	CARTS is the public transportation operator Chautauqua County.
Workforce Investment Board / Chautauqua Works	A local board appointed by the County Executive to transform a historically fragmented assortment of employment and training programs into a comprehensive, aligned and universal system. The goal is to reposition federal job training as a business-led, market-driven system to improve workforce quality.
All Star EMS	Provides comprehensive emergency response and medical intervention to Chautauqua County.
CC Department of Public Works	Responsible for maintaining and improving the public infrastructure and public properties of Chautauqua County.
CC Department of Health and Human Services	Protects and promotes the health, safety and self-reliance of all those in Chautauqua County and provides essential human services, especially for those who are least able to help themselves.
CC Office for the Aging	Provides programs and services to seniors and their families to promote independence, optimal health and wellness in a safe and secure environment.
CC Veterans Service Agency	Chautauqua County's link for veterans and their dependents for benefits provided by the Veterans Administration, Department of Veterans Affairs in Washington D.C.
Chautauqua Adult Day Services	A not for profit United Way agency that offers affordable Senior Day Programs for adults 60 years of age and older who live in Chautauqua County.
Chautauqua Opportunities Inc.	A community action agency leading the fight against poverty by mobilizing resources and creating partnerships to promote empowerment, economic independence and opportunities.
Career Systems Development	Empowers at-risk youth by providing the career training and life skills needed to build and sustain a brighter future.
Chautauqua Institution	501 nonprofit education center and summer resort for adults and youth.
Community Foundation	A nonprofit community corporation that serves the charitable purpose of benefiting the people of Chautauqua County.
Erie 2 BOCES	A public education collaborative in NY State that functions as an extension of local school districts of Chautauqua County. They offer adult and school aged services.
Heritage Group	Provides senior's rehab, skilled nursing, independent and assisted living options to Chautauqua County residents.
Jamestown Community Learning Council	Strengthens the capacity of families to nurture, support and provide for their child's academic development, emotional growth and physical well-being by establishing effective relationships between home and school.
Jamestown Community College	A public community college.
Lutheran Social	Provides a continuum of care that supports an individual's journey through life

SUB-COMMITTEES

Services	with compassion dignity and respect.
The Resource Center	TRC is a 5310 provider that services over 300 individuals of Chautauqua County's disabled community daily. It is also a provider of non-emergency
NYS Office of Temporary Disability Assistance	Provides help to vulnerable New Yorkers meet their essential needs and advance economically by providing opportunities for stable employment, housing and nutrition.
Southern Independent Living Center	A non-residential, private, nonprofit agency established in 1983 under the grant from the New York State Office of Vocational Rehabilitation. The purpose of the Independent Living Center is to provide services that will assist individuals with disabilities in reaching maximum independence and enjoying an enriched quality of life.
The Chautauqua Center	Offers a variety of high quality affordable health and wellness services in both Dunkirk and Jamestown.
The Resource Center	Provides support to individuals with disabilities and other challenges in achieving maximum independence, contributing to their community, experiencing lifelong growth, and enjoying quality life.
TEAM Services	Provides affordable transportation system ensuring accessibility and mobility to community resources, employment, and activities for individuals who are disabled, poor, and elderly or in need of assistance.
Coach USA	Coach USA is an intercity provider from Chautauqua County to Buffalo and the Randolph and Salamanca and Olean areas. Coach USA also provides non-emergency Medicaid rides coordinated by CARTS.
SUNY Fredonia Public Transportation	SUNY Fredonia is a 5311 provider of transportation in the village of Fredonia sponsored by Chautauqua County.
New York State Department of Transportation	The DOT serves as a funding source and assists with training.

Mobility Stakeholders Committee

PURPOSE

- Review and track the progress of the Coordinated Plan subcommittees
- Approve updates to the Coordinated Transportation Plan
- Involve all affected stakeholders in the planning and implementation process

MEMBERS

AGENCY	NAME	CONTACT INFORMATION
Chautauqua Works / Workforce Investment Board	Jennifer Blair	(716) 661-8492 jblair@chautauquaworks.com
	Kathleen Geise	(716) 661-9324 kgeise@chautauquaworks.com
	Cheryl Calhoun	(716) 487-5170 ccalhoun@chautauquaworks.com
CARTS	Michele Westphal	(716) 661-8488 westpham@co.chautauqua.ny.us
	Brenda Swan	(716) 661-8486 swanb@co.chautauqua.ny.us
The Resource Center	Mark Morton	(716) 661-1420 Mark.Morton@resourcecenter.org
Chautauqua County Health Network	TBD	(716) 338-0010
Chautauqua Adult Day Services	Karen Lucks	(716) 665-4899 kluck@seniordayprograms.com
Chautauqua County OFA	Mary Ann Spanos	(716) 753-4471 spanosm@co.chautauqua.ny.us
Chautauqua County HHS	Carmen Hlostac	(716) 753-4702 hlostac@co.chautauqua.ny.us
Chautauqua County VSA	Greg Carlson	(716) 661-8255 @co.chautauqua.ny.us
Chautauqua Opportunities Inc.	Sue Marker	(716) 366-8176 smarker@chautopp.org

SUB-COMMITTEES

Erie 2 BOCES	Kimberly Snyder	(716) 363-6101 ksnyder@e2ccb.org
Chautauqua County DPF	Brad Bentley	(716) 661-8406 bentleyb@co.chautauqua.ny.us
Coach USA	TBD	(724) 282-3080
Jamestown Community College	Ellen Ditonto	(716) 338-1199 ellenditonto@mail.sunyjc.edu
Senior Life Matters	Janell Sluga	(716) 484-6161 janells@lutheran-jamestown.org
Venture Forthe	TBD	(716) 285-8070
Heritage Village	Jessica Burkhouse	(716) 985-6701 jburkhouse@heritage1886.org
The Chautauqua Center	Rebecca Ruiz	(716) 363-6050 r Ruiz@thechautauquacenter.org
SUNY Fredonia	Vince Gugino	(716) 673-3338 Vince.gugino@fredonia.edu
Career System Development	Clara Swanson	(716) 366-9015 CSwanson@chautauquaworks.com
Lutheran Services	Diana Pillitteri	(716) 665-2680 diana@lutheran-jamestown.org
Fancee Transportation	Jeff and Lisa Davera	(716) 483-3661 fanceelimo@fanceelimo.com
Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance	Kendra Stockman	(716) 487-5129 kendrastockman@otda.ny.gov
TEAM Services Inc	Cindy Hitchcock	(716) 661-1519 cindy.hitchcock@resourcecenter.org
Southwestern Independent Living Center	Marie Carrubba	(716) 661-3010 marie@ilc-jamestown-ny.org

Resource Optimization Subcommittee / Collaboration Working Group

PURPOSE

To utilize all transportation providers in Chautauqua County to find the most efficient, cost effective mode of transit for the people within the county, particularly seniors, the disabled, low income, and employable working populations.

Objectives:

- By identifying all vehicle inventory in Chautauqua County
- By reviewing established transportation routes / schedules of transportation providers to avoid duplication, reduce emissions, lower cost, and coordinate transportation efforts.
- By creating / utilizing cost sharing services between agencies with Chautauqua County who have a vested interest in transportation.
- By exploring cost effective technology systems to aid in transportation scheduling.

MEMBERS

AGENCY	NAME	CONTACT INFORMATION
Chautauqua Works/Workforce Investment Board	Jennifer Blair	(716) 661-8492 jblair@chautauquaworks.com
TEAM Services	TBD	(716) 661-1519
The Resource Center	Mark Morton	(716) 661-1420 Mark.morton@resourcecenter.org
CARTS	Michele Westphal	(716) 661-8488 westpham@co.chautauqua.ny.us
	Brenda Swan	(716) 661-8486 swanb@co.chautauqua.ny.us
Chautauqua Adult Day Care Center	Frank Bercik	(716) 665-4899 frankadc@windstream.net

Update 2021:

This subcommittee will be revisited in 2021 once the initial Key Stakeholders Committee meeting has been conducted in April 2021. During this meeting an updated Needs / Gaps list will be created.

One-Stop Call/Click Center Subcommittee

PURPOSE

To create a centralized call center to provide the people in Chautauqua County, particularly seniors, disabled, low income and employable population's easy access to all transportation resources in the area.

Objectives

- By creating a centralized database of all available transportation resources in Chautauqua County.
- By creating a centralized website utilizing all modes of transportation available throughout Chautauqua County.
- By exploring all possibilities of cost sharing / staff sharing / and locations of a call center.

MEMBERS

AGENCY	NAME	CONTACT INFORMATION
Chautauqua Works/Workforce Investment Board	Jennifer Blair	(716) 661-8492 jblair@chautauquaworks.com
TEAM Services	Cindy Hitchcock	(716) 661-1519 Cindy.hitchcock@resourcecenter.org
Chautauqua County OFA	Mary Ann Spanos	(716) 753-4471 spanosm@co.chautauqua.ny.us
The Resource Center	TBD	
CARTS	Michele Westphal	(716) 661-8488 westpham@co.chautauqua.ny.us
	Brenda Swan	(716) 661-8486 swanb@co.chautauqua.ny.us

Update 2021:

This subcommittee will be revisited in 2021 once the initial Key Stakeholders Committee meeting has been conducted in April 2021. During this meeting an updated Needs / Gaps list will be created. This subcommittee will look explore the development of a Mobility website where all the transportation information will exist.

Transportation Accessibility Sub Committee

PURPOSE

To identify consumers in need of transportation services, offer continuous outreach, education and identification in mobility management systems throughout Chautauqua County, particularly seniors, the disabled, low income, and employable populations.

Objectives

- By identifying and maintaining customers.
- By developing appropriate travel training education to services agencies and to Chautauqua County residents.
- By providing continuous outreach to all customers.
- By evaluating and assessing progress of travel training for future of program development.
- By increasing access to all residents of the Chautauqua County community.

MEMBERS

AGENCY	NAME	CONTACT INFORMATION
Chautauqua Works/Workforce Investment Board	Jennifer Blair	(716) 661-8492 jblair@chautauquaworks.com
CARTS	Michele Westphal	(716) 661-8488 westpham@co.chautauqua.ny.us

Update 2021:

This subcommittee will be revisited in 2021 once the initial Key Stakeholders Committee meeting has been conducted in April 2021. During this meeting an updated Needs / Gaps list will be created. During the COVID pandemic it has been extremely difficult to have movement in this area.

INVENTORY OF SERVICES AND RESOURCES

Provider	Days of Operation	Hours of Operation	Number of Vehicles	Funding Source(s)	Public / Private
Chautauqua Area Regional Transit System (CARTS)	Monday - Friday	6AM – 6PM	34 Buses (All ADA Accessible)	5311 Eligible	Public
The Resource Center (Chautauqua County Chapter ARC)	Monday – Friday	5AM – 5PM	16 Buses (All ADA Accessible)	5310 Eligible	Private
TEAM Services	Monday – Friday (On call 24 hrs. a day with 24 hrs. notice)	8AM – 2PM (Office Hours)	6 Buses 4 Ambulatory, 8 Wheel Chair (All ADA Accessible)	5310, 5316, 5317 Eligible	Private
Coach USA	Sunday - Saturday	4:30AM – 7:30 PM 9:30AM-3:10PM (Sun.)	1 Non ADA Accessible	5311	Public
Chautauqua Adult Day Care Centers, Inc.	Monday-Friday, Saturday	8 AM – 4PM	5 (3 ADA Accessible)	5310 Local Shares	Private
SUNY Fredonia	Sunday-Saturday	7:15 AM-10:50 PM	3 (All ADA Accessible)	5311	Public
Chautauqua County Veterans Service Agency	Wednesday and Friday service to Buffalo	6AM – 5PM	1 (ADA Accessible)	Local Funds/ Donations 5310 Eligible	Private

WHAT DATA MUST WE HAVE TO DETERMINE SERVICE NEEDS?

Population Density

Why is this important?

It is important to determine whether or not more people are moving into Chautauqua County and, if they are, where the population is increasing. This information shows where the County needs to enhance or diminish services to remain cost-effective yet also best serve residents.

Senior Population

Why is this important?

We need to determine how great of a need there is for increased transportation for seniors. Is Chautauqua County's population relatively old or young when compared to the rest of the state and the nation? If the population is aging quickly, then there will be more demand for these services as time moves on. In this case, we would need to share services and costs in order to avoid increasing the burden on taxpayers.

Low-Income Population

Why is this important?

Low-income individuals are significantly more likely than average earners to utilize public transit as a means to get to and from employment, medical services, and other services. The low-income population of Chautauqua County is significant to Job Access Reverse Commute (JARC) funding.

Major Employers

Why is this important?

Significant service to the major employers of Chautauqua County needs to exist in order to provide individuals with access to these jobs. This is also significant to JARC funding. Along with medical facilities, transportation services for employment activities are the fundamental pillars on which a coordinated transportation plan needs to be developed.

Medical Facilities

Why is this important?

The elderly and disabled are significantly more likely than the average population to access public transit, often to reach medical services. Extensive service to these facilities is a requisite in any coordinated public transportation plan.

DEMOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS

The associated maps contained in "Attachment III" represent the current population disbursements of the following five categories based on the 2000 Census:

TABLE 1: POPULATION

YEAR	CITY OF JAMESTOWN	CITY OF DUNKIRK	CHAUTAUQUA COUNTY
2010	31,146	12,563	134,905
2000	31,730	13,131	139,750
1990	34,681	13,989	141,895

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 1990, 2000, and 2010 Censuses

According to Table 1 above, Chautauqua County has faced a population decline over the past two decades. This trend is also reflected in both the cities of Jamestown and Dunkirk, the two cities located within the County.

TABLE 2: SENIOR POPULATION

CATEGORY	CITY OF JAMESTOWN	CITY OF DUNKIRK	CHAUTAUQUA COUNTY
Seniors 60+ (2010)	6,198	2,631	30,528
Seniors 60+ (2000)	6,228	2,837	28,308
%60+ Pop. (2010)	19.9%	20.9%	22.6%
%60+ Pop. (2000)	19.6%	21.6%	20.2%
NYS %60+ Pop. (2010)	19.0%	19.0%	19.0%
U.S. %60+ Pop. (2010)	18.5%	18.5%	18.5%

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2000 and 2010 Censuses

According to Table 2, the senior population (defined here as people aged 60 and over) has increased slightly over the past decade in Chautauqua County despite an overall decline in general population. The senior populations in the cities of Jamestown and Dunkirk are considerably higher than the U.S. average, and the City of Jamestown's senior population as a percentage of total population has

DEMOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS

increased. The senior populations of the County and the cities of Jamestown and Dunkirk are considerably higher than the United States and New York State levels.

The associated maps contained in "Attachment III" represent the current population disbursements of the following five categories based on the 2000 Census:

TABLE 3: LABOR AND INCOME

CATEGORY	CITY OF JAMESTOWN	CITY OF DUNKIRK	CHAUTAUQUA COUNTY
% in Labor Force (2000)	62.1%	58.8%	61.4%
U.S. % in Labor Force (2000)	63.9%	63.9%	63.9%
Median Household Income (2000)	\$25,837	\$28,313	\$33,458
U.S. Median Household Income (2000)	\$41,994	\$41,994	\$41,994
Mean Travel Time to Work (2000)	15.1 min.	16.2 min.	18.4 min.

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2000 Census

TABLE 4: LABOR AND INCOME CONTINUED

CATEGORY	CITY OF JAMESTOWN	CITY OF DUNKIRK	CHAUTAUQUA COUNTY
% in Labor Force	62.8% (+/-2.0%)*	62.2% (+/-3.2%)	60.4% (+/-0.9%)
NYS % in Labor Force	63.7% (+/-0.1%)	63.7% (+/-0.1%)	63.7% (+/-0.1%)
U.S. % in Labor Force	65.0% (+/-0.1%)	65.0% (+/-0.1%)	65.0% (+/-0.1%)
Median Household Income	\$33,092 (+/- \$1,954)	\$33,849 (+/- \$2,513)	\$40,639 (+/- \$1,127)
NYS Median Household Income	\$55,603 (+/- \$178)	\$55,603 (+/- \$178)	\$55,603 (+/- \$178)
U.S. Median Household Income	\$51,914 (+/- \$89)	\$51,914 (+/- \$89)	\$51,914 (+/- \$89)
Mean Household Income	\$42,215 (+/- \$1,829)	\$42,966 (+/- \$2,526)	\$50,823 (+/- \$1,047)
NYS Mean Household Income	\$80,374 (+/- \$276)	\$80,374 (+/- \$276)	\$80,374 (+/- \$276)
U.S. Mean Household Income	\$70,883 (+/- \$123)	\$70,883 (+/- \$123)	\$70,883 (+/- \$123)
Mean Travel Time to Work	14.9 min. (+/-0.9)	13.3 min. (+/-1.2)	17.6 min (+/-0.4)

DEMOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS

NYS Mean Travel Time to Work	31.3 min. (+/-0.1)	31.3 min. (+/-0.1)	31.3 min. (+/-0.1)
U.S. Mean Travel Time to Work	25.2 min. (+/-0.1)	25.2 min. (+/-0.1)	25.2 min. (+/-0.1)

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2006-10 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates

***Margin of errors shown in parentheses**

Tables 3 and 4 show that the residents of Chautauqua County have median and mean household incomes well below the national and state averages. The households of Dunkirk and Jamestown have considerably lower incomes than the county average. Compared to state and national levels, lower percentages of the residents of Chautauqua County as a whole and the cities of Dunkirk and Jamestown are in the labor force. The low-income are the most likely to use public transit so, with Chautauqua County's relatively low levels of income, there is a significant market for these services. We need to give this segment of the population the necessary opportunities to find work

With the short average commute times of Chautauqua County residents, public transit may emerge as a more viable option. In a county without any major traffic issues, driving is almost always going to be a faster option than public transit. However, if a person's commute time is already short, then he or she would likely be more willing to add a few more minutes to that already short commute time in order to save some money, avoid the hassles of driving alone, and reduce fossil fuel emissions.

TABLE 5: POVERTY AND HOUSING

CATEGORY	CITY OF JAMESTOWN	CITY OF DUNKIRK	CHAUTAUQUA COUNTY
% Families Below Poverty Level (2000)	15.8%	18.5%	9.7%
% NYS Families Below Poverty Level (2000)	11.5%	11.5%	11.5%
% U.S. Families Below Poverty Level (2000)	9.2%	9.2%	9.2%
Median Housing Value	\$52,400	\$52,100	\$64,000
NYS Median Housing Value	\$148,700	\$148,700	\$148,700
U.S. Median Housing Value	\$119,600	\$119,600	\$119,600

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2000 Census

As shown in Table 5, the percentage of families below the poverty level in Chautauqua County is relatively even with the U.S. average. Within the two cities of Jamestown and Dunkirk this percentage

DEMOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS

is much higher, which likely indicates a higher percentage of public transit riders in these two cities. It is this segment of the population that is most likely to use transit as a means to get to and from work, medical appointments, and other services. This has a large implication for JARC funding in order to increase transit accessibility for these residents for employment purposes.

DEMOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS

TABLE 6: POPULATION BY DISTRICT

CITY/TOWN/ VILLAGE/HAMLET	POP. (2010)	POP. (2000)	%60+ POP.	POP. DENSITY (POP./SQ. MILE)
Dunkirk	12,563	13,131	20.9%	2,792.8
Jamestown	31,146	31,730	20.5%	3,460.7
Arkwright	1,061	1,126	21.1%	29.7
Busti	7,351	7,780	27.7%	153.8
*Lakewood	3,002	3,258	30.4%	1,501.0
Carroll	3,521	3,635	25.4%	105.4
*Frewsburg	1,906	1,965	26.8%	560.6
Charlotte	1,729	1,713	19.2%	96.5
**Sinclairville	588	665	21.0%	367.5
Chautauqua	4,464	4,666	26.5%	66.4
*Mayville	1,711	1,756	21.8%	855.5
Cherry Creek	1,118	1,152	20.7%	30.5
*Cherry Creek	461	551	21.1%	329.3
Clymer	1,698	1,501	18.5%	47.0
Dunkirk	1,318	1,387	41.9%	209.2
Ellery	4,528	4,576	32.2%	95.1
*Bemus Point	364	340	35.9%	910.0
Ellicott	8,714	9,280	28.5%	285.7
*Jamestown West	2,408	2,535	36.2%	963.2
*Celoron	1,112	1,295	23.9%	1,588.6
*Falconer	2,420	2,540	23.4%	2,200
Ellington	1,643	1,639	18.2%	44.9
French Creek	906	935	18.9%	25.0
Gerry	1,905	2,054	29.2%	52.6
Hanover	7,127	7,638	23.4%	144.6
*Forestville	697	770	19.2%	697
*Silver Creek	2,656	2,896	18.8%	2,414.5
Harmony	2,206	2,339	23.5%	48.5
*Panama	479	491	26.5%	217.7
Kiantone	1,350	1,385	26.1%	73.0
Mina	1,106	1,176	21.5%	30.8
North Harmony	2,267	2,521	26.3%	53.7
Poland	2,356	2,467	22.4%	64.0
Pomfret	14,965	14,703	17.5%	340.9
*Fredonia	11,230	10,706	15.4%	2,159.6
Portland	4,827	5,502	19.0%	140.7
*Brocton	1,486	1,547	21.0%	874.1
Ripley	2,415	2,636	22.1%	49.4
*Ripley	872	1,030	24.6%	622.9
Sheridan	2,673	2,838	24.5%	71.7
Sherman	1,653	1,553	16.2%	45.5

DEMOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS

CITY/TOWN/ VILLAGE/HAMLET	POP. (2010)	POP. (2000)	%60+ POP.	POP. DENSITY (POP./SQ. MILE)
*Sherman	730	714	19.3%	912.5
Stockton	2,248	2,331	21.7%	47.5
*Cassadaga	634	676	28.3%	704.4
Villanova	1,110	1,121	21.9%	30.7
Westfield	4,896	5,232	27.6%	103.7
*Westfield	3,224	3,481	27.5%	916.1

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2000 and 2010 Censuses

Legend	
	City
	Town
	Village
	Census-Designated Place

****A village or census-designated place (dark blue and light green colors in the table above) is located within the town (darker green color) listed above it (example: Forestville and Silver Creek are villages located within the Town of Hanover). The population of the village or CDP is included in the town it is located within.***

*****Sinclairville is located on the border of the Town of Charlotte and the Town of Gerry***

It is important to understand the population centers of Chautauqua County to predict where demand will be strongest. The areas with the most population should have higher demand and thus more service from transportation providers. Areas with higher senior populations should demand more alternative transportation, as seniors are less likely to use their own private vehicles to travel than the general population.

NEED/GAP ANALYSIS

ANALYSIS PROCESS

- 1) What population is currently served?
 - 2) Where is this population?
 - 3) How many annual trips are provided?
 - 4) What various uncoordinated transportation providers are currently performing these services?
 - 5) Whose needs are not being met?
-

BASED ON THIS ANALYSIS AND ALL DATA COLLECTED, WE CAN MAKE THE FOLLOWING ASSESSMENTS:

Duplicative service exists in the following areas (areas over-served):

- City of Dunkirk
- City of Jamestown
- Jamestown to Dunkirk/Silver Creek
- Jamestown to Westfield
- Jamestown to Clymer
- Jamestown to Frewsburg
- Jamestown to Sinclairville/Cherry Creek
- Dunkirk to Stockton/Cassadaga
- Dunkirk to Ripley

This duplication is provided by as many as three providers in some areas; however, there are various reasons for this duplication. In the City of Jamestown and Dunkirk, there is public transit via fixed route or dial-a-ride service. In addition, The Resource Center and Adult Day Care Centers are utilizing their vehicles to pickup/return their clients during peak hours of the day (between 7 AM – 9 AM and 3 PM – 5 PM). This duplication exists due to the peak time and increased need for additional vehicles to accommodate the ridership. Review of each provider's pickups is needed to determine where the actual overlap is occurring. Further review of the rural areas is needed to determine if the duplication is due to capacity issues or lack of coordination. Duplication exists between the public Coach USA inter-city routes from Jamestown to Buffalo, the CARTS system (to Dunkirk & Silver Creek), and the Chautauqua County Veterans Service Agency bus. Further review is also needed to determine the extent to which this is due to lack of coordination or capacity issues.

Update 2021:

Over served areas / duplication of services has been addressed and will continue to be reviewed to ensure transportation services are consolidated and duplication is avoided.

Limited service exists in the following areas (areas under-served):

- Southern and western portions of the County, primarily the townships of Ripley, Mina, French Creek, Clymer, and Harmony
- Eastern area of the County, including Villenova, Cherry Creek, Ellington, and Poland

Update: 2021

Service to Sherman and Findley Lake area have increased from 2016 to 2020. In 2020 Route 40 was cancelled due to COVID 19.

NEED/GAP ANALYSIS

Further review is needed to determine if the duplication of services is due to capacity issues or lack of coordination.

No service exists in the following areas (areas with no service):

- Service is provided in every township on at least a limited basis.
-

Need/Gap Priority Survey

During the Mobility Stakeholders Committee meeting held on December 2, 2011, the committee completed a survey to determine the level of importance (priority) for each of the preceding needs and gaps. The survey was sent to all committee members who were not present at the meeting. Below are the final results based on survey responses; the needs are ranked and colored. 1 is the most desirable and 20 is the least while darkest colors are the most desirable. Attached in Attachment V are the survey tallies and methodology.

LEVEL OF PRIORITY BASED ON SURVEY OF MOBILITY STAKEHOLDERS COMMITTEE: 2011

1. Early morning, evening, and weekend service
2. Need for transportation opportunities for people with disabilities to attend work centers and other programs
3. Need for employer inventory/survey/support of public transportation
4. Need for a one-stop center for transportation
5. Need for more travel training
6. Limited rural service
7. Limited education of transportation services available
8. Flexibility for early shifts, overtime, and last minute change in shift time
9. Cab fare structure for multiple agency pickups/better coordination
10. Underutilization of park-and-ride with transit (used mostly for carpooling)
11. Lack of incentive for employees to take transit for Welfare to Work
12. Limited service for combination trips (i.e., children to daycare and parent to work)
13. Employer education on commuter tax benefits
14. Need to coordinate carpooling
15. Accessible cabs (vans with wheelchair lifts)
16. Holiday service
17. Need for driver training for people with disabilities
18. Emergency breakdown of mobility aid (i.e., battery on mobility chair dies)
19. Affordable purchases of cars for low-income to get to work
20. Limited out-of-state service

LEVEL OF PRIORITY BASED ON SURVEY OF MOBILITY STAKEHOLDERS COMMITTEE: 2016

Need/Gap Priority Survey 2017

During the Mobility Stakeholders Committee meeting held on December 14, 2016, the committee completed a survey to determine the level of importance (priority) for each of the preceding needs and gaps. The survey was sent to all committee members who were not present at the meeting. Below are the final results based on survey response.

1. Extending weekday evening's hours for people with afternoon medical appointments / continue to look into weekend service.
2. Need for transportation opportunities for people with disabilities to attend work centers and other programs
3. Need for employer inventory/survey/support of public transportation. Flexibility for early shifts, overtime, and last minute change in shift time
4. Need for one – stop center for transportation
5. Limited rural service – increase rural route service.
6. Lack of incentive for employees to take transit for Welfare to Work
7. Limited service for combination trips (i.e. children to daycare and parent to work)
8. Employer education on transportation services available
9. Holiday service
10. Need for driver training people with disabilities
11. Need for certified bus drivers

PROPOSED MOBILITY PROGRAM

LEAD AGENCIES

Chautauqua Works and Chautauqua Area Regional Transit (CARTS)

PARTNERS

1. **Chautauqua County - CARTS Public Transportation** – CARTS will expand the use of the scheduling and dispatch software that will be purchased through NYS DOT Section 5311 funds to better coordinate services and reach the goal of a one-stop call center.
2. **Chautauqua County DSS** – The DSS will assist with educating the public about public transportation and coordinate low-income employment and training trips.
3. **Chautauqua County OFA** – Will help to educate its clients and the public about public transportation. This agency will partner with Adult Day Service Centers to help fund transportation for seniors.
4. **Chautauqua County Veterans Service Agency** – This agency will continue to contract with CARTS to provide drivers and maintenance and coordinate dispatch for the VSA bus program.
5. **The Resource Center** – TRC will work to educate its clients and the public about public transportation. TRC and CARTS will consolidate overlapping routes as the two agencies analyze routes by area.
6. **TEAM Services** – TEAM will also participate in the consolidation process between TRC and CARTS.
7. **Chautauqua Adult Day Care Centers** – Chautauqua Adult Day Centers will continue to coordinate with CARTS to provide service to the day care centers located in the North and South County and in Westfield.
8. **Coach USA** – Coach USA will continue to provide intercity service from Chautauqua County to Buffalo and the Randolph, Salamanca, and Olean areas. Coach USA will also continue to provide non-emergency Medicaid rides coordinated by CARTS.
9. **SUNY Fredonia Public Transportation** – SUNY Fredonia will continue to provide rides in the Village of Fredonia.
10. **New York State DOT** – The DOT will continue to serve as a source of funding and guidance throughout the coordination process.
11. **Chautauqua County DPF** – The DPF will continue to provide a fueling site for the VSA's bus, and the DSS Medical van. CARTS will provide maintenance to the VSA's bus, DSS Medical van and any overflow from the Sheriff's Department.

RIDE NEEDS (NEED RIDES BUT HAVE NO VEHICLES)

- Office for the Aging (OFA) Non assisted senior living centers

PROPOSED MOBILITY PROGRAM

- Department of Social Services (DSS) / Mental Health Services
- Jamestown Community College / Jamestown Business College
- Chautauqua Works
- Area Employers

FUNDING SOURCES

- Federal & State (5310, 5311, JARC, STOA)
- Chautauqua County
- Inter-agency/department contractual funds
- Fares
- Donations
- OFA - senior population
- HHS – working population
- The Resource Center (TRC)
- WNY Development Disabilities Services Office (DDSO)

IDENTIFIED SERVICE AREAS (BY PROVIDER)

- ⇒ **CARTS and The Resource Center/TEAM Services** – all of Chautauqua County
- ⇒ **Coach USA** – serves the corridor from Jamestown to Dunkirk and then to Silver Creek. In addition, they serve the corridor from Jamestown to the outlying eastern counties
- ⇒ **Chautauqua Adult Day Care** – serves Jamestown, Dunkirk, and Westfield and surrounding areas
- ⇒ **SUNY Fredonia** – serves the Village of Fredonia and the SUNY Fredonia campus
- ⇒ **Chautauqua County Veterans Service Agency** – provides transportation to any Chautauqua County veteran in need of transport to Buffalo VA hospitals

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

Broad Goals

The two major goals in this project are to **(1) improve transportation services for the senior, disabled, and low-income residents of Chautauqua County** and to **(2) coordinate the needs and actions of local transportation providers, human service agencies, employers, and individuals**. Each of the goals and strategies explained below has been developed to achieve one or both of these overarching goals.

Update 2021:

Major goals will be revisited at Key Stakeholders Committee meetings to ensure outcome is being met. If goal needs updating the proper subcommittees will begin immediately to ensure strategies are developed and goals are being worked on and met. Goals are all ongoing to assure consistency of service.

Due to COVID 19 Pandemic all goals will be re-assessed to determine need and ensure need continuing to be met.

Focused Goals & Strategies

GOAL #1: ELIMINATE/REDUCE DUPLICATION OF SERVICES

Strategy to meet this goal:

Establish working group of transportation providers to analyze areas of over-service

Current Situation

Chautauqua County currently has seven transportation providers, each targeting slightly different segments of the population. The routes and schedules, as well as the clientele served, of these providers partially overlap. Certain areas and times of day are over-served, while other areas and times are under-served. The Need/Gap Analysis displays where the current needs and gaps in services exist. This lays out where duplication exists, which are the areas and times that need to be analyzed. If duplication is reduced, providers should be able to add services to serve the areas and the times that are currently under-served.

Chautauqua County Future Outlook

When all transportation providers are brought to the table to discuss the viability of the transportation system as a whole, the most obvious discussion points should involve where these providers are offering more services than they need to. To improve efficiency, one's mind first jumps to consolidation and elimination of duplicative routes and services. The Collaboration Working Group under the Resource Optimization Subcommittee under the has been established to analyze the routes area by area to determine where routes can be merged, eliminated, and changed to become more efficient. With improvements in efficiency, transportation providers will be able to extend services to under-served areas and times.

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

Update 2021:

COVID Pandemic has changed how public / private transit agencies are operating. Due to the pandemic some agencies are no longer providing transportation services or are providing limited services. The Mobility manager will conduct a new Inventory of Services to ensure accuracy and consistency of information in 2021.

Projects to Meet Strategy:

1. TRC and CARTS worked to merge TRC's Route 3 with CARTS' existing routes in the Sinclairville-Cherry Creek-Ellington-Kennedy-Jamestown area. – **Completed – 8/2012**
2. All CARTS routes are uploaded on the state GIS system, while TRC has several routes in the system. TRC is making changes to routes and will send its routes to the State in the future. – partially completed – **CARTS Completed**
3. Establish working group within the Duplication of Services Subcommittee to target specific agencies and get only the involved agencies at the table. – **ongoing**
4. TRC / TEAM Services Inc / CCADC will get routes completed to be put on overlay of GIS on CARTS routes. – **Completed – 9/2013**
5. Find vendor for GIS data – **Completed 11/2013**
6. TRC / TEAM Services Inc. / CCADC will get all data on spread sheet to get to person to complete GIS overlay – Target 1/2014
7. Begin process for TEAM Services Inc to become a public transit – **Key Stakeholders approval 9/2013.**
8. Meeting with John Reel DOT to begin to define action plan for TEAM Services Inc to go public - **Completed 11/12/2013**
9. Begin to develop contract / plans with TEAM Services Inc to go public – **ongoing – Target date 4/1/2014**
10. Non-emergency medical transportation for Western New York was taken over by Medical Answering Services (MAS) in 2014 – public transit agency is experiencing a lot of duplicate services. Working with MAS and to avoid duplication of services. **2014 –ongoing**
11. Upstate NY Medicaid Public Transit Issues collaborative working group was developed on Basecamp to aid in the Non-Emergency Medical Transportation problems / duplication of services / lost rides transit agencies are dealing with. **6/2014 - Ongoing**
12. Begin working with Jamestown High School CDOS program. **3/2015 Completed**
13. Contract completed – TEAM Services Running Pilot Route 40 in the Findley Lake area – **6/2016**
14. TEAM Services Inc. pilot became an official route on CARTS schedule - **2017**
15. TEAM Services Route 40 Ended due to COVID – **3/2020**

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

GOAL #2: SHARE SERVICES AND COSTS ACROSS AGENCY LINES

Strategy to meet this goal:

1. Multiple agencies collaboratively purchase GPS fleet management software

Current Situation

CARTS and other transportation providers do not currently utilize fleet management software to track their vehicles. Currently, dispatchers from a home base must communicate to drivers where they need to go and how to get there when new customers call in. The dispatchers must predict where drivers are on their routes and then, based on those predictions, contact the closest driver to a new requested pickup. Providers have no concrete method to tell if a driver is efficient or inefficient because the provider has limited oversight over its vehicles. Fleet management software and hardware can monitor speeding and other unsafe driving, give a warning if a vehicle is idling too long, and keep a record of every stop that a driver makes. Providers can run reports on individual drivers and groups of drivers on various criteria to determine which drivers are the most valuable and which ones need improvement. This software can also eliminate the printing of schedules; drivers would view continually updated schedules on tablets in their vehicles. CARTS alone is exploring the purchase of fleet management software, but other providers can piggyback onto this purchase. If several transportation providers purchase the same GPS fleet management software, each provider can see where other agencies' vehicles are and where duplication occurs. Fleet management software should result in greater efficiency within transportation providers' operations as well as the knowledge of the locations of multiple agencies' vehicles throughout the day.

Chautauqua County Future Outlook

A CART was approved funding to purchase fleet management software. RouteMatch, the company that provides the software that CARTS currently uses, offers GPS fleet management services. If CARTS determines that less training and adjustment time will be needed with the implementation of RouteMatch software, this will be a significant factor in the decision process. There are other vendors to consider in this process. The main characteristics of an effective fleet tracking system in Chautauqua County are: all vehicles from all participating agencies can be tracked, but vehicles from different agencies are distinguishable; billing information can be extracted easily to expedite the billing process; pickup schedules can be sent in real-time to tablets in vehicles; and vehicles can be tracked in real-time. With fleet management software and hardware, agencies will be able to detect duplication and determine where consolidation can take place. Getting experts from different agencies together to talk about various targets and strategies to reduce duplication is a great help to the process, but being able to see the routes and the raw information will also be beneficial.

Update 2021:

Goal will be re-evaluated in 2021 due to COVID pandemic.

Projects to Meet Strategy:

1. CARTS applied for Section 5311 grant funding to purchase fleet management software and hardware – **approved in 7/2012 for approximately \$182,000**
2. Reach out to other transportation providers to potentially buy technology together – **in progress - ongoing**

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

3. Contact vendors to present their products in preparation for a competitive bid process. Multiple vendors need to be a part of this process. – **First presentation on 7/11/2012, second presentation on 8/15/2012, third presentation 8/2013.**
4. Route Match Software Company initiated fleet management software for CARTS – **March 2016**
5. CARTS applied for Modernization Enhancement Program Grant (MEP Grant) and was awarded grant funding – **February 2020**
6. The MEP Grant will fund the following enhancements to CARTS scheduling system utilizing Route Match Software Company: Notification software (funded by 5311 grant), Mobile phone application and a cashless fare application – **2021 - 2022**

GOAL #3: FORMULATE ONE RESOURCE FOR ALL TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION IN THE COUNTY

Strategy to meet this goal:

1. Create a one-stop center for all transportation needs

Current Situation

Chautauqua County does not currently have one location where people can call, access via the Internet, and/or physically go to in order to access all county transportation information. This can deter people from using public transportation; some people will not use a service or product if the essential information is not available in a simple format.

Chautauqua County Future Outlook

The Steuben County model, piggybacking a one-stop call center onto an existing service, is the most realistic for Chautauqua County to follow. United Way set up a one-stop call center in Chautauqua County several years ago, but it shut down at the end of 2010 because it was not cost-effective due to low call volume. Due to this history, it is most realistic to attach a one-stop call center to existing services. United Way operates a 2-1-1 telephone service for western New York out of the Olmstead Center for Sight in Buffalo, and that service may be able to absorb Chautauqua County transportation information to become a one-stop call center. NY Connects is a local call-in service that provides callers with information on services that fit callers' needs. NY Connects will serve anyone that calls, though it is primarily used to refer callers to medical services. It currently does not provide detailed transportation information to callers, but it is feasible to integrate this information into the service. With its proximity to Chautauqua County, Steuben County can serve as a valuable resource for Chautauqua County's efforts. Transportation providers in Chautauqua County can easily witness first-hand how Steuben coordinates with the Finger Lakes 2-1-1 service and use Steuben's process as a model.

Update 2021:

Chautauqua County Mobility Manager will create a webpage link from the Chautauqua Area Regional Transit Systems website with a transportation directory in 2021 and Mobility resources 2021 – 2022.

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

Tasks to Achieve Strategy:

1. OFA and RSVP have been coordinating with Medical transportation to provide volunteer drivers to transport elderly and Medicaid client to medical appointments. OFA will turn over the scheduling of the volunteer drivers to CARTS. OFA will also provide a Senior Aide to CARTS to assist with the scheduling **by 09/30/09 – GOAL MET**
2. **By 11/09** – Assess dispatch and scheduling software coordination module to add to the current software. Medicaid staff, Veterans and Volunteer program are now utilizing software through CARTS – **1/1/11.**
3. Inventory transportation providers that are willing to be a part of the one-stop call center by **2011. ONGOING**
4. Apply for Section 5311 funds to fund the Coordination module in next grant process – **2012 – ONGOING.**
5. Develop system for operation of call center - **2012.**
6. Determine staffing needs, funding (cost sharing) and support for any additional staff needs - **2012.**
7. Develop marketing plan to advertise new call center by **2012.**
8. Launch One-Stop Call Center by **2013.**
9. Visit to Steuben County to observe the workings of their coordinated transportation system, specifically its integration with the 2-1-1 service. – **7/26/2012**
10. Phone meeting with Access Allegany pertaining to how one stop center works – **8/2013.**
11. Develop a plan of action to how / where a one stop call center will be implemented in county - **ongoing**

GOAL #4: PROVIDE TRAVEL TRAINING FOR THOSE IN NEED OF THE SERVICE

Strategies to meet this goal:

1. Provide a travel training program that satisfies the needs of low-income, disabled, and senior residents

Current Situation

Chautauqua County is poor and aging when compared to the rest of the state and nation. Low-income and elderly populations are significantly more likely to access public transportation than the average population. With these demographics, public transportation should be a very important and highly utilized part of infrastructure in Chautauqua County. However, it has not yet reached that status. There are reasons why more people do not access these services, so Chautauqua County needs to work to resolve whatever these reasons are.

People may be afraid of riding alone, may not understand the schedules and routes, may be unable to afford public transportation, or may be unaware of the services offered. We need to determine what these reasons actually are, then establish a travel training program to provide these services. Through local agencies, volunteers can be recruited to ride along with first-time users of public transportation, explain bus schedules to those who do not understand them, and/or educate those who do not know the multitude of services available.

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

Chautauqua County Future Outlook

Presentations are currently being held at all of Chautauqua County's non assisted living facilities to educate the senior population on public transit. A survey is completed at the end of the presentation to see if further workshops on travel training are needed for this particular age group. We have developed a survey to distribute to local human service agencies (to distribute to their clients) in order to determine what travel training needs people have. The agencies we have targeted for this survey serve primarily low-income, disabled, and elderly clients; these target populations are more likely than the general population to utilize public transportation or have a need for public transportation. Based on this survey, we can focus on the most important travel training needs and decide on the best solutions to fulfill these needs. We are currently launching our Travel Training – Train the Trainer Training to area Mobility Stakeholders and members of the Coordinated Transportation Plan. The training consists of classroom training to educate people on what it involves to utilize public transit, a public transit bus demo, and a real time trip on public transit complete with transfers. Classroom education includes: trip planning, path of travel, assessment process, task analysis, pedestrian safety, street crossing ADA resources, and preparing for travel. Beginning November 2013, the Mobility Manager will begin working in conjunction with Chautauqua Works WIB providing a travel training workshop to job seekers of Chautauqua County. Public transportation, routes, schedules, fares and service types will be explained. People will have the opportunity to discuss any issues, questions or concerns regarding transportation in this workshop. . A survey is completed at the end of the presentation to see if further workshops on travel training are needed to target this particular population. Individual / group travel training workshops are currently being developed from survey results mentioned above and any need that comes up in the future. By continuously surveying the people of the county we will better meet their needs and adapt any training, workshop, or presentation designed around travel training.

Update 2021:

Travel training has continued since its fruition in 2015, and will continue to be developed depending on person / persons need.

Projects to Meet Strategy:

1. Formulate a travel training needs survey and accompanying letter to distribute to local human service agencies. – **completed 3/29/2012**
2. Distribute the survey and letter to at least ten local human service agencies. – **completed 8/2012**
3. Compile survey results and incorporate results into this plan – **deadline for return of surveys is 9/14/2012**
4. Determine what travel training needs are apparent then use those results to formulate the next step in this process – **anticipated 9/2012 – ongoing to meet changing needs of public and community.**
5. Conduct public transit awareness to area non assisted living facilities – **began 10/2013 ongoing**
6. Soft launch of TRAIN the TRAINER on Travel training to area service agencies - **10/4/2013, 11/8/2013, 12/6/2013. Completed 2015**
7. Workshops conducted at Chautauqua County One Stop for people wanting education on

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

public transportation. – 11/14/2013 – ongoing every Thursday

8. Mobility Manager conducts travel training to individuals or small groups in need. – ongoing
9. Developed travel training brochure – 2018
10. Developed employer brochure regarding Mobility Management Services – 3/2021

GOAL #5: INTRODUCE INNOVATIVE NEW PROGRAMS AND/OR ADD TO EXISTING PROGRAMS TO SUPPLEMENT THE SERVICES OFFERED CURRENTLY

Strategies to reach this goal:

1. Expand the breadth of the volunteer driver program
2. Establish a rideshare program

STRATEGY #1: VOLUNTEER DRIVER PROGRAM

Current Situation

The Retired Seniors Volunteer Program (RSVP), the Office for the Aging (OFA), and CARTS currently work together to operate a volunteer driver program to transport people to out-of-county medical appointments. The program gives preference to seniors. The agencies suggest that people make an appointment for a ride at the very least a week in advance. Riders are given an envelope to mail in a suggested donation amount based on the number of miles traveled, but they can donate as much or as little as they choose. The program currently has 15 overall drivers, five of whom drive the bulk of the trips. RSVP recruits most of the volunteers, primarily targeting retired residents. RSVP interviews all prospective volunteers. Volunteers are reimbursed at \$0.555 per mile plus toll costs and up to \$5 for food depending on the duration of the trip. CARTS handles the paperwork for reimbursement.

Chautauqua County's transportation providers currently tailor to individual transportation needs for rural residents by conducting door-to-door and curb-to-curb service for residents. When buses or vans have to go off track to pick up riders, this adds to fuel costs, wear and tear due to increased vehicle mileage, and more pay to drivers due to more time on routes.

Models

Steuben County operates two separate volunteer driver programs: The Steuben Coordinated Transportation's Volunteer Driver Program (SCT-VP) provides food-related, non-emergency medical, and human service agency trips to any resident without access to any other means of transportation, while the Steuben County Transportation Scheduling Service (SCT-SS) to serve eligible residents who receive benefits from the Department of Social Services. The County developed the SCT-VP because public transportation is not always a viable option due to the rural geography of this area. Rather than extend the public transportation system's resources to serve these customers, Steuben County developed the volunteer driver program to reach them. Riders schedule rides through the 2-1-1 service, and then volunteers pick up the riders free of charge. Volunteers use their own vehicles and are reimbursed for miles driven, meals, and any parking expenses incurred while volunteering.

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

Within a month of their rides, riders are notified of the suggested donation amount, but no rider is denied because he or she does not or cannot pay the donation.

Sullivan County also operates a volunteer driver program. This program is very similar to Steuben County's program, which seeks to provide trips to those without access to transportation. Sullivan County's demographics are very similar to Chautauqua County's, so the County decided to form a volunteer driver program in response to community needs. In a rural area, it is impossible for a public transportation system to serve every transportation need and remain financially viable at the same time. First, riders schedule rides by contacting the Volunteer Driver Coordinator, then volunteers will come to pick them up and connect them to public transportation if realistic; if this would not fulfill their needs, volunteers will take them to and from their appointment or trip. According to information released by Sullivan County, from July 2011 to February 2012 the program has fulfilled over 90% of ride requests at an average cost of \$14.60 per ride. It has provided 1,092 trips, 71% of which were to medical trips, 20% to dialysis trips, and 9% to personal trips. The program has 36 volunteers and is available 24 hours a day, 7 days a week.

ITNAmerica is a nationwide non-profit. The classic ITNAmerica program is designed to serve dense metropolitan and suburban areas, but ITNEverywhere has been developed to serve communities like Chautauqua County. This program is intended to serve people of all ages, but focuses on the senior population. Tomkins County has contracted with ITNAmerica to be a part of its ITNEverywhere Community Pilot program. ITNAmerica operates separate but affiliated volunteer driver programs in each region under the umbrella of ITNAmerica; account balances can be transferred to any ITNAmerica program. ITNAmerica partially reimburses drivers for gas costs while driving, making up the difference with transportation credits. These credits can be transferred to a family member, saved for later, or donated. A person can donate his or her car to the program in exchange for credit; this can be useful for seniors who cannot or do not want to drive themselves anymore.

Chautauqua County Future Outlook

While the existing program in Chautauqua County provides a helpful service, it serves a limited clientele and is unsustainable. One of the major goals of the coordinated transportation process is to become more sustainable and improve transportation services for seniors, the low-income, and the disabled. As an alternative to transportation providers, Chautauqua County should look to establish a more extensive volunteer driver program that takes from existing models. Rather than invest money in ITNEverywhere, we can pull the ideas from that program that will best fulfill local needs as well as draw ideas from other similar programs. The goal is to establish a sustainable volunteer driver program that can supplant some of the wide-reaching routes that certain transportation providers run. The most crucial element of a successful volunteer driver program is a plentiful staff of motivated, capable drivers. To attract volunteers, the program could explore several options: pay stipends to long-term drivers, compensate volunteers with service later (like the personal account system of ITNAmerica), and give public transportation credits in return for volunteering. More volunteer agencies should be involved in this process than one (currently only RSVP).

Currently the public transportation services charge a premium fare (yet extremely reasonable when compared to other alternatives) fare to go off-route to pick up customers; the volunteer driver program should charge comparable fares to keep the program financially viable. Rather than a donation system, like what is currently utilized by the volunteer program, a fare system would allow for the program to bring in guaranteed revenue. Optimally, the program should supplant some of the public

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

transportation services currently offered. The buses used by CARTS and other agencies should be used to provide scheduled route service and to serve those with special needs (the disabled and others that would have difficulty getting into and traveling in a regular passenger motor vehicle), while a volunteer system would be able to serve those with transportation needs that are not on or near existing routes but are able to ride in a regular passenger motor vehicle.

Update 2021:

Ride share will be a major focus of 2021.

STRATEGY #2: RIDESHARE PROGRAM

What is a Rideshare program?

A rideshare program consists of either or both carpools and vanpools. *Carpools* form when a person has space in his or her vehicle on a commute and decides to bring one or more passengers along in exchange for gas money or some other benefit. The members of the group may alternate who drives if each member has access to his or her own vehicle. *Vanpools* are essentially large carpools that utilize a rented or leased van with high capacity rather than an automobile. Vanpools consist of groups of around 6 to 15 people, with only certain members certified as drivers. Each member contributes a share of leasing, gas, and maintenance costs. The drivers may pay a lesser share or nothing at all in exchange for driving and maintaining the vehicle. The members of both carpools and vanpools live close to one another, work close to one another, and have similar work schedules. In most cases, a carpool or vanpool group has a set schedule that the group follows all the time, barring schedule changes made and agreed upon in advance.

Current Situation

Chautauqua County's proximity to the significantly more populous Erie County and City of Buffalo necessitates a need to transport workers from Chautauqua County to Buffalo as well as within Chautauqua County. When analyzing Erie, Chautauqua, Cattaraugus, Alleghany, and Wyoming Counties, 75% of this region's population is centered in Erie County. Population centers likely hold the most job opportunities; so many residents from the other counties in this region are likely commuting to Erie County for employment. Though it is important to provide transportation within Chautauqua County, it is also important to work to provide transportation to employment hubs like Buffalo. These residents will theoretically be able to earn higher incomes in an area like Erie County with more job opportunities. Thus, they will have more money to inject into the local economy along with the other added benefits that come with increased income.

Ridesharing needs to be emphasized by various county agencies and local employers as a major part of this goal. Both carpooling and vanpooling are realistic solutions to increase the options that Chautauqua County residents have. Many people do not own their own cars. CARTS public transit and Coach USA can only offer a limited number of routes at certain times; they cannot serve every resident's needs due to costs and capacity issues. Carpools and vanpools are more options that will ideally motivate residents to travel to quality training and find gainful employment by alleviating transportation concerns.

Models

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

The state of Wisconsin has a statewide rideshare program. The program first developed and succeeded in the most populous parts of the state, southeastern Wisconsin and the Madison metropolis, then was spread to the entire state and its bordering counties. The State Department of Transportation operates a website (<http://www.dot.wisconsin.gov/travel/commuter/rs-index.htm>) in which residents can register their commute information and run searches for potential matches. Users can integrate their Facebook accounts with their rideshare accounts so that other users can see their public information before choosing a match. This website also has a well-developed employer section that clearly lays out the many benefits of promoting a rideshare program and the options available to employers to realize these benefits.

The JobJet program in six rural Iowa counties (Audubon, Carroll, Crawford, Greene, Guthrie, and Sac) grew from a concept suggested by two of the biggest employers in the county, Tyson Foods and Farmland Foods. This has been marketed to citizens and bureaucratic groups as a program that supports local economic development and provides transportation access to work. The total population of these six rural counties is only a little more than half that of Chautauqua County's while covering a land mass approximately three times larger. This vanpool model has been implemented in areas far more rural than Chautauqua County, which bodes well for the viability of a vanpool program in this area. This program coordinates work schedules and locations to arrange workers into groups of four to ten people for each of the six vanpools. Members live in close proximity to one another, work in the same general location, and have similar work hours.

Chautauqua County Future Outlook

Chautauqua County should work to market the benefits of ridesharing to local employers and residents. One way to do this is to establish a ridesharing website in which residents can submit information and locate potential matches. There are numerous third party websites that seek to act as this facilitator, but the County can do a significantly better job at this. The County has the resources and the connections to local employers to promote the program to both these employers and the residents they employ. A government-led rideshare program should leave clients with a greater sense of security than a faceless website, such as Craigslist or eRideShare, without any significant oversight. Though a statewide system like Wisconsin's is likely unrealistic in the much more populous and demographically diverse state of New York, Chautauqua County can derive many facets of that system to its local program. An easy-to-navigate website catering to both employers and employees is necessary. Extending the service to neighboring counties would be a great precedent to follow, as well.

The County needs to consider adding a vanpool system in which a lead agency would facilitate and potentially partially subsidize the cost of a vanpool. Buffalo is the second largest city in New York and, especially in the North County, many residents commute north to Buffalo's metropolitan area for employment. There are currently many private vanpool options available, but many residents will not necessarily pursue these options unless they are aided by a knowledgeable governmental agency and given some added incentive to do so. For a vanpool system to work, employers must be involved in every step of the process to coordinate schedules, promote the program, and hopefully provide benefits to its employees that utilize the service.

The Commuteride program in Ada County, Idaho, in which the large city of Boise is located, outlines several elements leading to a successful rideshare program:

- ◆ Develop innovative partnerships

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

- ◆ Reach out to and involve area employers
- ◆ Understand unique needs of individual communities
- ◆ Obtain strong political support from local leaders
- ◆ Emphasize ease of use for business by, for example, working with reliable, experienced third-party operators
- ◆ Emphasize ease of use for commuters
- ◆ Ensure access to a guaranteed ride home

Assorted Future Goals to Develop

- Educate employers on the need to support transportation and assist with education to their employees. Also, employers need to be educated about the transportation tax benefits available to employers.
- Develop a comprehensive "Marketing Plan" to encompass all transportation available in Chautauqua County.
- Determine the need for a full-time staff person to market the transportation and continue the education process required to keep the public, agencies and employers in the know about transportation.
- Review and assess the Regional Plan and determine how Chautauqua County can better connect with our neighboring counties.

Update 2021:

- Assist Health and Human Services Department with getting free transportation to COVID vaccinations sites.
- Re-invigorate the use of Ride share with area employers to assist in employee job retention, and getting to work during off hours when service providers do not provide transit.
- Determine if a bike share program would work with in Chautauqua County and give residents additional modes of transport.

Assorted Projects to Achieve Broad Goals

Projects to Meet Strategy:

1. OFA and RSVP have been coordinating with Medical transportation to provide volunteer drivers to their program. OFA will turn over the scheduling of the volunteer drivers to CARTS/Medical Transportation. OFA will provide a Senior Aide to CARTS/Medical Travel to assist with the scheduling **by 09/30/09 – GOAL MET.**
2. Implement an "Individualized Transportation Plan" for agencies/transit to be able to assess a clients/riders transportation needs and options **by 12/1/2013.**
3. Assess and evaluate a plan among our partners to reduce duplication of services and routes **by 01/01/10** (on-going).
4. Evaluate the under-utilization of vehicles during evenings and weekends and determine where vehicle sharing can take place – **2010 - ongoing.**

MAJOR GOALS & STRATEGIES

5. The Jamestown Gateway Station Intermodal and Visitor Center renovation project located on 2nd Street between Jefferson and Washington Streets will provide for passenger transfers between the CARTS system and the Coach USA inter-city. Renovations to this facility will begin in 2009 with an anticipated completion in 2010. The proposed facility will allow for a waiting area, rest room facilities and information – **completion 2013**
6. Complete bus stop sign installation in rural areas – **completed 12/10**

EXPECTED BENEFITS

Achieving these major goals using the strategies listed above will result in numerous benefits:

- ❖ **Duplicative services will be eliminated or reduced** due to increased communication between agencies. This process has brought transportation providers closer than before and has forced each to look beyond the scope of their own agencies to the big picture. Costs would be reduced by consolidating services. We would be able to leverage multiple funding sources, identify unleveraged funding sources, and pursue community contributions from local businesses.
- ❖ A more centralized call and/or web service for transportation information will give clients **easier access to information**. A single phone number and/or website can be **marketed to the public** more so than disparate resources. Clients will no longer need to call around or search around to find what transportation services they are eligible to receive, what providers serve their areas, or what providers operate during the times they need to be transported.
- ❖ A travel training program for riders of public transportation will help **increase ridership** as well as increase the visibility of transportation to the public, employers, and agencies. A travel training program will help to transport more elderly, disabled, and low-income residents to necessary services and **inject money into the local economy**.
- ❖ Investing in GPS fleet management software and hardware will result in **greater efficiency** for transportation providers. This software will allow dispatchers to track vehicles in real-time and monitor all aspects of driver performance. Transportation providers will be able to determine where inefficiencies occur. Billing and dispatching will be more efficient, as an electronic record of all travel is kept and can be extracted.
- ❖ A rideshare program would give residents, specifically those with low incomes, another relatively **inexpensive, alternative mode of transportation to get to work** and access employment-related training and activities. Carpooling is more flexible than public transportation and may make it easier for parents to transport their children to day care services.
- ❖ A volunteer driver program would **supplement existing public transportation**. A volunteer driver program would be able to give rides to transportation-challenged riders who do not need special accommodations and are able to ride in a personal motor vehicle without assistance. A robust volunteer driver program with a full staff of volunteers would limit public transportation's responsibilities to fixed route service and serving those who need assistance to ride in a vehicle.
- ❖ The **burden on taxpayers will be reduced** as consolidation occurs. The goal is to offer the same level of services at lower costs by **pursuing and implementing alternative solutions** to the needs of community residents.

CONCLUSION

We will work to coordinate the transportation providers of Chautauqua County to further expand access to the senior, disabled, and low-income citizens of Chautauqua County who need these services to remain in their homes and communities. The results of this coordination could be significant in cost savings not only to the agencies providing or utilizing these services, but also to the local taxpayer who is supporting these services through general fund dollars. This will be an ongoing working plan that will benefit the residents, riders, agencies and employers of Chautauqua County alike.

Through the following courses of action, a more efficient and effective mobility program will emerge:

- Foster communication between agencies
- Share services and costs
- Compile all transportation information into one place
- Explore and utilize potential technological solutions to problems
- Determine unmet needs
- Add additional programs (rideshare program, volunteer driver program, etc.) to supplement existing services

These benefits are to be expected:

- Provide more rides
- Increase service area
- Decrease vehicle needs
- Improve lines of communication between riders and agencies
- Easier access to jobs for the low-income and to services for the elderly and disabled, which results in more money in communities
- Tax savings for residents
- Keep residents in local communities

On a grander scale, a coordinated transportation system will:

- Improve the quality of life for all Chautauqua County residents
 - More transportation for the low-income to access jobs results in more opportunities for this segment of the population to earn higher incomes
 - Higher income levels correlate with less crime, higher levels of education for offspring, and better health
 - Less crime and better health result in lower costs to society
 - Low-income individuals earning more results in less government assistance
- Establish a precedent of coordination in our local governments
 - If transportation providers in Chautauqua County can prove that sharing services and costs and making the tough decisions for the best of its people is effective, this can spill over into other sectors of our government as well as others
- Provide much-needed services to the most vulnerable segments of our population
 - Transportation services for the elderly, disabled, and low-income are necessary for a developed society
 - These necessary services need to be provided with management of resources in mind