

Chautauqua County Legislature
Live Streamed on YouTube
Wednesday, February 28, 2024 6:30 p.m.
Mayville, N.Y. 14757

Chairman Chagnon called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

Chairman Chagnon: I will call to order the meeting of the Chautauqua County Legislature on February 28, 2024. Would the Clerk please call the roll?

Clerk Lee called the roll and announced a quorum present.

Legislator Penhollow delivered the prayer and pledge of allegiance.

MOVED by Legislator Bankoski, SECONDED by Legislator Wilfong and duly carried the minutes were approved. (01/02/2024)

MOVED by Legislator Bankoski, SECONDED by Legislator Vanstrom and duly carried the minutes were approved. (01/24/2024)

1st Privilege of the Floor

Chairman Chagnon: That brings us to our first privilege of the floor. Members of the public may comment on any subject relating to any local law, resolution or motion appearing on the agenda. Individual comments are limited to three minutes and comments representing a group shall be limited to five minutes.

I'm Emily Reynolds from Cornell Cooperative Extension. I live in Sherman, New York. I'll be brief because I'm just going to introduce you to Josie Allen. She is our 4-H Educator and she has some information to share with you about the Agricultural Literacy Week that you have a motion on the floor about today.

Hi, my name is Josie Allen. I am from Sherman, New York and as she said, I am the 4-H Development Educator and this year we are again doing the Ag Literacy Week. We are looking for volunteers to read to schools in the County for scheduled times. The book this year is called "I Love Strawberries". It's a book about a young girl that really likes strawberries and wants to show her parents that she can grow the fruit. I think it's a really nice book that connects books with agriculture. They don't have to be directly living on a farm to be involved in agriculture. We are currently looking for readers as well as donations. All of these books get donated to the school library and any other funds that are collected, are used to do a small activity with the kids. The Agriculture Literacy Week this year is March 18th through the 22nd.

Ms. Reynolds: So if anybody is interested in being a reader, please reach out to us at Cooperative Extension and we appreciate your support on the motion that you have in front of you, declaring that it is Ag Literacy Week.

My name is Doug Champ and I live at 225 Bowen Street in Jamestown. I've also been a resident of this County for going on close to 80 years, that's 8 decades and I've talked many times in front of the Legislature over a varieties of issues over the years and tonight I'm addressing actually some type of mathematical interpretation on the resolutions in front for salary raises. And I'll read this, "In 2024, our County Legislators will be making \$9,000 a year plus add-ons for specific titles. If this resolution tonight as presented and adopted, these legislator salaries will increase to \$14,732, a 61% increase. There are 12 months of County Legislature meetings a year. That amount relates to \$750 a meeting, per legislator. If these meetings last for 2 hours each, that relates to \$375 an hour. If each legislator attends 12 additional monthly meetings a year, like a committee meeting, for 2 hours each, that accumulated hourly rate goes down to \$187.50 an hour. If an additional 12 meetings per year are attended at an hour each, the hourly rate goes down to \$150 an hour. Now I do not know how many of nonpolitical hours your spend doing your job that add to these accumulative hours, phone calls, emails, texting, letter writing, etc. Only you know, if you keep such an accountable log. Comparison tonight to the County Executive's salary of \$111,400 or \$9,283 a month or \$2,142 a week. If the County Executive works 40 hours a week, he would earn \$53.55 an hour. If he works 50 hours an week, we would be making \$42.84 an hour. 60 hours a week he would be making \$35.70 an hour. Do you see where I am going with this? In conclusion, at an increase of \$5,732 of salary increases for 19 county legislators equates to \$108,908 a year. If that amount stays constant for the next 10 terms, after 2026, it will cost the County tax payers \$2,178.160. That's the facts of the math.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you, you've exceeded your three minutes.

Mr. Champ: I always do, that's why I wish you would amend it to make it 5 minutes.

Chairman Chagnon: Anyone else wishing to address the first privilege of the floor? Seeing no one, I will close the first privilege of the floor.

**VETO MESSAGES FROM COUNTY EXECUTIVE WENDEL
NO VETOES FROM 01/02/2024 & 01/24/2024**

Clerk Lee: Our office has received the 5 communication as listed on the agenda, if you would like a copy of any of these items, please let our office know.

COMMUNICATIONS:

1. **Conewango Watershed Commission Minutes – January 10, 2024 Meeting, Attached with Cattaraugus County Soil and Water Conservation District Report**
 2. **Affidavit of Publication (2) – Legal Notice – Local Law Intro 1-24 (Post Journal and Observer)**
 3. **Affidavit of Publication (2) – Legal Notice – Local Law Intro 2-24 (Post Journal and Observer)**
 4. **Minutes – Conewango Watershed Commission – February 14, 2024 Meeting**
 5. **Letter – NYS Department of State – Acknowledgement of Local Laws 1-24 and 2-24**
-

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 3-24 – A Local Law Amending Local Law 13-22 Providing for a Management Salary Plan for County Officers and Employees (re: Coroner Supervisor for the Department of Health) – R/C Vote: 19 YES; 0 NO; – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 4-24 – A Local Law Amending Local Law 13-22 Providing for a Management Salary Plan for County Officers and Employees (re: Law Graduate for the Chautauqua County Law Departments) – R/C Vote: 19 YES; 0 NO; – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 5-24 – A Local Law Amending Local Law 7-07 Real Property Tax Law Section 459-C “Persons with Disabilities and Limited Incomes” Real Property Tax Exemption – R/C Vote: 19 YES; 0 NO; – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 6-24 – A Local Law Amending Local Law 13-22 Providing for a Management Salary Plan for County Officers and Employees (re: County Historian) – R/C Vote: 19 YES; 0 NO; – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 7-24 – A Local Law Amending the Chautauqua County Charter (Amending Section 4.05)

Legislator Larson: Mr. Chairman, I confess that before taking office in January, I had no idea that (*inaudible*) for 2018, the charter was amended to increase salaries for the Executive the Sheriff and the Clerk and for the first time in County history, add an automatic annual cost of living adjustment. Since these offices have automatic annual increases, so for example, the Executive salary was set in the charter at \$92,500 and now I think it's \$115,000 just these few years later, I see no need any longer for a salary review commission. If for some reason the duties of the Executive or the duties of the Clerk or the duties of the Sheriff were expanded someday, if the County bought back the County home for example, and the Executive was suddenly responsible for that big Enterprise again, then a salary review commission could be needed to decide if there should be a pay increase for added duties. If the Sheriff someday takes

over one of the municipal police forces, I could see the salary review commission saying that for those added duties there ought to be an increase but, short of that Mr. Chairman, with the automatic cost of living increases, I see no need for a salary commission mandate period, thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments or questions on local law introductory 7-24? Seeing none, would the clerk please call the roll?

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 7-24 – R/C Vote: 17 YES; 2 NO (Larson, Parker) – ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 8-24 – A Local Law Amending the Chautauqua County Charter (Amending Section 4.06)

Legislator Larson: Mr. Chairman, since the short title there doesn't explain to the audience or to the press what we're talking about, section 4.06 of the charter right now is the 2018 provision that set the County Executive salary at \$92,500 as of January 1, 2018 the Clerk as of January 1, 2018 of \$55,500 and the Sheriff, because his election is a different cycle, his salary was set as of January 1, 2019 is \$85,000. Those salaries became the base for applying the annual cost of the Consumer Price Index cost of living adjustment for each of those three elected people. If we delete those starting points, we delete the initial calculation, the base for calculating the annual cost of living adjustments. I, it's no secret I will not be voting for any additional increases for the Executive, Sheriff or Clerk because this Legislature, just those few years ago said that as of 2018, \$92,500 was a fair compensation for Executive and so forth. And then, adding the first ever in this County's history, automatic cost of living adjustments every year that should be adequate. So, I do not favor eliminating this section. What this local law would do is, delete the base amounts that some of you voted for just those few years ago and instead, set off on increases on top of the Consumer Price Index for these offices starting after their next election cycle. So I hope I've made my thought clear I think it's important for history to not delete from the charter. What this legislature thought was fair compensation for the Executive, Sheriff and the Clerk in 2018 and 2019 and that explains how \$92,500 just those few years ago, has become \$115,000 this year. By deleting the initial base amounts that you all agreed to, the compensation starting in 2026 makes no sense to anybody trying to read our Charter. So for that reason, I'll be opposing deleting what you all did in the charter for 2018, thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Anyone else have comments, questions or discussion on local law introductory 8-24? Seeing none, would the clerk please call the roll?

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 8-24 – R/C Vote: 14 YES; 5 NO (Bankoski, Buchanan, Larson, Nelson, Parker) – ADOPTED

Legislator Larson: Mr. Chairman, (*inaudible*) information to the County Attorney. Now that that whole sections has been deleted, if this legislature fails to act on the next local laws, how does the Budget Director, the Finance Director, the Human Relations Department, how do they determine what the salary is for these three elected officials in the next few years?

County Attorney: So that would be something that we'd work on with Human Resources and the Budget Director. They have the information of what's currently being made. That section in the charter was just outdated language. That's no longer the base salary so to have that continue to be in there causes more confusion than actually removing it for the Budget Director.

Legislator Larson: Well, with all due respect, since these salaries go up every year, a figure in the charter is always going to be outdated within a year.

County Attorney: Yes, correct. That's why it's being removed.

Legislator Larson: But the language of the local laws that are proposed tonight, you read them and they do not tell you what the salary is going to be in 2026, correct?

County Attorney: Correct. The County does have systems in place that calculate and maintain the knowledge of what the current salaries of what people are being paid. Payroll obviously has to pay out salaries and so based on information, they would apply the new CPI appropriately and would pay accordingly.

Legislator Larson: I'm really not trying to put you on the spot, but I don't think this is a well-conceived plan this evening. One has always been able to look at a law Mr. Chairman, and see what this body had set the salary of these elected officials to be as if right now we've eliminated the only reference as to what the salaries of these elected officials is. I know I lost the vote but the point remains the only reason we can tell what the Executive makes in 2024, that all three of these people got a raise last month. The only way we know what it is, is because we had the starting amount in the charter and then it said they get CPI every year so it's a simple calculation. Now that we've deleted the base amount in the charter, I don't know how any anyone would research County Law and figure out what the salary of these three electives is as a matter of law, thank you.

County Attorney: Since I believe at least the 1960's, we do maintain journals of proceedings and so this information would maintain in those journals that are available at - actually the Clerk's office is now digitizing all those journals of proceedings to make them easier to research.

Legislator Larson: Well perhaps- last comment, Mr. Chairman, we don't need the history we just needed what this legislature did in 2018 that answers the question of what they made and the CPI applied every year. It's a simple thing, it is now not a simple matter under the proposed laws, thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you, carry on.

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 9-24 – Establishing Salary Level for Chautauqua County Executive

Legislator Parker: I wanted to first thank the Salary Commission and also the HR Director for all the work that they put into figuring out the raises and I think they did an extraordinary amount of work and I appreciate that but I wanted to reiterate what Legislator Larson said about the CPI or the COLA increases. Since 2020, the increase has been close to 20% if not more of living increases and I think this will continue to, as it is part of the charter, will continue to supply for meaningful raises for the Executive for the Clerk and for the Sheriff and I am not going to be voting for that, thank you.

Legislator Wilfong: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I'd like to thank the many concerned citizens that have reached out to me with some questions and concerns regarding the findings of the Chautauqua County Salary Commission. The commission's task was to look into elected officials pay scales and make recommendations on them. I believe that we need to take a look at all the proposed recommendations and make some common sense adjustments to them. The Republican caucus holds the super majority voting advantage on the floor and will be leading the negotiations on these issues. The Republican caucus is made up of business owners, banker's retirees, and factory workers which represent a large group of blue collar workers that reflect a cross-section of our County. I can assure you this has brought forth a lively conversation in our caucus and just because we all belong to one political party, does not mean we all agree on the complex issue before us. I hope that all Chautauqua County residents have reached out to their County legislator to express their opinion and proposed changes to County government. I'd like to clarify one issue that has been misrepresented in the Post Journal many times, (*inaudible*) we will now be voting ourselves a pay increase. It will take place during the next election cycle. I believe we also need to look into that the CPI is very important I think for all of these positions because then we won't find ourselves in the same problem that we're having where the legislators themselves haven't had pay raises in 20 years. So it's going to be interesting to see how these few Votes go and I'll tell you there's probably going to be some fireworks so good luck, thank you.

Legislator Niebel: Mr. Chairman, if this goes through the County Executive's salary will be approximately \$131,000 per year, keep in mind the County Executive has oversight of 1,500 County employees and a budget of \$300 million for the County so those things considered, I don't think this salary increase is exorbitant. I think it's warranted and I will be supporting it this evening. Thank you.

Legislator Larson: Mr. Chairman, thank you. One good thing at least for me that came out of the salary commission's analysis was those volunteers and we commend them. Believe it or not, I was asked and did serve on a salary review commission when I was in exile and our recommendations which was as I recall the committee was led by the County Republican Chairman at the time. Our recommendations came to the Legislature and the Legislature did nothing with them. Now I didn't feel offended that I had spent time trying to come up with pay raises but of course that was an ERA where none of these folks got automatic cost of living increases. I appreciate the work of the commission and for me, when they listed what they considered to be comparable counties to Chautauqua, which led me to do some research on were

they comparable to us? Sadly, the US Census Bureau shows the nine counties that the commission saw as comparable to Chautauqua. The median household income average for those nine counties was \$76,000 for households in those nine counties. Our median household income sadly is \$55,000, \$21,000 less median household income than the average of the nine allegedly comparable counties and I have thought to myself in this week leading up to tonight's decision what would Chautauqua County look like if the typical household suddenly had \$21,000 more dollars a year here in Chautauqua County so we'd be the average of those nine other counties? I think we'd have a much different place to live. Might even still have a Cadillac dealer in Jamestown. Then I looked at the Census Bureau again on what's the poverty rate? We don't talk about poverty rate much, I don't myself but the Census Bureau keeps track of it. The nine comparable counties according to the salary commission, their average poverty rate is 12.9%. Ours is 17.6%. So our economic circumstance sadly is way below the nine comparable counties and what does that have to do with salaries? Well, the ability of the people, the residents of this County, to pay is much much less sadly than those other nine comparable counties, thank you.

Legislator Pavlock: Yes, in regards to the section 406, at the time I was in favor and voted in favor of those numbers because it was a step in the right direction. I wasn't completely satisfied but I was satisfied at the time that we were moving in the right direction so I'm thankful today that we were able to have established a commission. I've always been an advocate for that over the last few years, it's just taken a few years to be able to get that to come to fruition. We had a thing called a pandemic that kind of turn tabled that a little bit. I'm glad that we were able to do it. Then, the commission met us and now I'm even more glad that the recommendations that they put forward because it does satisfy what I thought those salaries should have been and so I'll be in support of this particular introductory that we're discussing right now.

Legislator Parker: I just wanted to point out something that when we were talking about the comparison of the nine comparable counties, I had the opportunity to do some other research and one of the things that I thought was really kind of remarkable about Chautauqua County is that as we've talked before, we have a reduction of -7.58% of our population and if you look at (*inaudible*) County, which was county which was one of the comparison Counties, they have a reduction in their population of .79. Putnam County was another one and they had a reduction since 2010, 1.87% and I think what I wanted to say which is a little different, is that we really need to be looking at what is different about Chautauqua County when we're making decisions and looking at the ways forward and I think there are so many different ways of looking at the differences and it's pretty remarkable. To look at an almost 8% reduction in population and then versus the comparison Counties with less than 2% or in some cases have gained population. So those are pretty significant numbers too, thank you.

Legislator Penhollow: Mr. Chairman, perhaps we are looking this under microscope for just Chautauqua County versus New York State and to make a point to Mrs. Parker, I think that's the issue that nobody's been talking about here is what New York State has done to Chautauqua County in the exodus of our population. I think that's one of the key things, we can cherry-pick here all day long on salaries. Do we question salaries of our law enforcement? Not really. Do we question salary increases for our school teachers and our community leaders and our school

leaders? We really don't. So I will be voting in favor of the increases for the County Executive based on if I run a \$300 million year company, am I going to do it for \$115,000 a year? And don't forget our County Executive, our Clerk, and our Sheriff, they eat here in Chautauqua County, they buy groceries here in Chautauqua County. We've seen how COVID has exasperated all costs in everything that we do. Services, cost, insurance, that's not a County issue. I believe this is more of a larger State issue than it is a County issue and so I don't speak that often but to sit here and to nitpick and put on a microscope of our leadership? We want to hire the best superintendents, we want the best men or women qualified to apply, to run an election, or to be a Sheriff. We want the best Attorneys in Chautauqua County, I know I do. I want to hire the best doctors and I want those doctors working on my kids, my parents, and my siblings and those are just some of the points. I understand the struggles that each of us face, our residents, especially in my districts. So I think that those are just important points so thank you.

Legislator Vanstrom: Good evening Chairman, thank you. I just want to say I have been in government many years, many, many years and in many capacities and I can tell you that the role of County Executive in this County is multifaceted. You have to become a quasi-expert in so many fields including finance. There is no way anybody could pretend it is a 9 to 5 job. You're at the mercy of our taxpayers 24/7 when there's a crisis you're toes are held to the proverbial fire. So there's no way that anyone could say that it doesn't take a lot of energy and a lot of expertise and a lot of planning and a lot of communication with all of the department heads on top of other educational endeavors to do the very best job for our community here. So I want to thank the Salary Review Commission for their diligent work, their sensible analysis, and their generous donation of time and attendance to these issues because I wouldn't have volunteered if I could. I'm not lying about that. Terry might have, but not me, no. So I mean, really I do give a credit to that position that we're discussing right now but if anybody had a peek behind the curtain, they'd realize that it is a very, very in depth job to preform, so thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments, questions or discussion on local law introductory 9-24? Seeing none, would the clerk please call the roll?

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 9-24 – R/C Vote: 13 YES; 6 NO (Bankoski, Buchanan, Larson, Nelson, Parker, Wilfong) – ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 10-24 – Establishing Salary Level for Chautauqua County Clerk

Legislator Larson: Just so whatever the audience is, is clear, all three of these elected officials are getting raises regardless of action on these local laws. They all got raises last month based on the Consumer Price Index. Nobody including this Legislature, has brought a local law to repeal the charter provision for Consumer Price Index. So that nobody in the audience is confused, no matter what happens with these local laws, the Sheriff, the Executive and the County Clerk get automatic raises every year so it's not like the old days. I think Mark - well I shouldn't have researched it but I believe County Executive, Mark Thomas, was stuck at 80 – stuck, I think his salary was \$85,000 for 8 years and then Greg Edwards served seven of his eight years I believe at \$85,000. In the old days we did have public elected officials who were literally

stuck at the same pay for 10, 15 years just like -- has anyone researched since the legislators has been frozen for 22 years? Anybody know for sure? Anybody document? We know it's at least 20. 20 with no increase. These three elected officials once again, everybody understands they're already getting automatic cost of living increases every year so they're not frozen like the old days for a County Executive or a Clerk or a Sheriff, thank you.

Legislator Johnson: Just in response to that, please. So I grew up in some Countries that has pretty high inflation so when you don't add CPI to a salary every year, the amount of stuff you can buy with that salary goes down. Your real compensation goes down, it's not stuck. So if you want to keep people whole, you have to use CPI or some metric to it. So that was just the mathematical point I wanted to make, otherwise everybody's going backwards, thank you.

Legislator Wilfong: Well I'm sure most people did notice that I did vote no for the County Executives increase. I do believe that the County Clerk's position is extremely underpaid and I will be voting in favor of that but I just wanted to speak to you that when I first spoke this evening, I said that not everybody's getting along when it comes to the pay increases and you're starting to see that and I think it's important that each one of us actually says what they believe the way County Government should go and I'm very proud of the people who stood up to say what they wanted to say, so thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments or discussion on local law introductory 10-24? Seeing none, with the clerk please call the roll?

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 10-24 – R/C Vote: 14 YES; 5 NO (Bankoski, Buchanan, Larson, Nelson, Parker) – ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 11-24 – Establishing Salary Level for Chautauqua County Sheriff – R/C Vote: 13 YES; 6 NO (Bankoski, Buchanan, Larson, Nelson, Parker, Wilfong); – ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 12-24 – A Local Law Amending Local Law 7-99 Establishing Salary Levels for Chautauqua County Legislators

Legislator Larson: Mr. Chairman, one of the things that I decided 20 or 30 years ago was even in politics and government, to try to be as intellectually honest as possible. There's no reason that most of the 19 on this Legislature now in 2024, have no personal knowledge of in 1971, was the first election for a County Legislature. The nature and responsibility of this body can be misunderstood and Mr. Wilfong said something extremely profound I think it was our organizational meeting he said “We the County Legislature, we work with the County Executive, we don't work for the County Executive”. With the election of 1971, the first County Legislature for three years there was no Executive, there was no County Manager. The County Legislature ran the County. The Chairman of the Legislature was as close to an executive figure we had for 3 years. So the history of the County Legislature is not an advisory body to a County Executive, a reactive body all the time to whatever the County Executive, whoever it is proposes. Our origin is the central part of County government, the Executive came after. So let's not shy away from

letting the public know and try to prove it to them that this is a serious group of 19 and it is the central part of County government decision making. Secondly, to lump together, it's unfortunate in a way tonight has all four of these local laws. For whatever reason, in 2018 the County Legislature at that time gave a Consumer Price Index annual automatic increase to the Sheriff the Executive and the Clerk and did not give a Consumer Price Index to the \$9,000 legislator salary. I don't know why but they didn't. So in historical fairness, and intellectual honesty 12 years ago and more, there were 25 legislators each making \$9,000. When the Legislature shrunk itself to 19, it eliminated 6 legislators at 49,000 a year it cut \$54,000 just in gross pay and did not raise the salary for the rest. Secondly, I believe under the crusade of Dr. Rudy Mueller as a County Legislator, the County Legislature got rid of health insurance for itself. There were a lot of self-employed people, farmers and others over the years that being a County Legislator meant that they could have County health insurance. I didn't burden our finance people with what is County health insurance worth today to a single or a family but, it's a lot of money. This body voluntarily gave up health insurance which has got to be worth more than \$9,000 a year and yet kept the pay at nine, so it's just not intellectually honest to lump the discussion of Legislator salaries with those of the Exec, the Clerk and the Sheriff who had new higher base salaries set in that law of 2018 and have had automatic cost of living since the \$9,000 for this job this responsibility has been unchanged for over 20 years, the body shrunk itself saved the taxpayers that \$54,000 a year, plus Social Security, Medicare. Gave up health insurance and what that would be today if even half of the 19 took advantage of health insurance like it was available in the old days that'd be a lot of money. Gave all that up and the pay stayed the same so just in fairness to the body there's no comparison between the three countywide elected and this body, thank you.

Legislator Nelson: Mr. Chairman, my simple answer is no thank you. I appreciate the efforts of the salary commission however, no thank you. Now can we get on with talking about something else? Can we talk about how we're going to stop the population loss in the County? Or how we're going to improve the economic future of the county, a county that ranks near the bottom of all the counties in the state? So let's not waste any more time on this and move on to more important things, thank you.

Legislator Bankoski: Mr. Chairman, I just want to reiterate my thanks and I think I speak for everyone here of the salary commission who did all the research. Deb Makowski in the back also spent a lot of time, hours and to put together at least a proposal that we had some very good discussion on. I know it wasn't an easy task, Mr. Chairman, because you burdened me with it when you said "Can you go please find me three or four people to sit on this commission so it would be bipartisan"? And it wasn't easy by no means. I knocked on a lot of doors, called a lot of people and a lot of people said "No thank you" "Don't have time" "Don't really care". The people that we did get, I thought they were upstanding people both Democrats and Republicans and I thought they did an admirable job so I take my hat off to them. I was in favor of the raises for the big three, as I refer to them as but then I forgot about the CPI thing that's been added to their salary from since 2018 and I was a legislator at that time and I voted for it just because it was hard to find people that want these jobs. They were making more money in the private sector than they do working in the public sector here. But I totally forgot about the CPI thing and that really is what changed my mind on how I voted on those three just because they all got raises

this year they got raises last year and I understand you know, comparing other counties and this and that or whatever. It is what it is, and I voted my conscience on those but as far as the legislator goes and none of us may be here two years from now when this whole thing takes place, we might all get voted out so you know so be it, whatever the case may be. So we may not even get any benefit of the proposed Legislative increase. I thought to myself, 20 years I mean minimum wage has gone up year after year you know, everyone's got a little something. I didn't feel that the \$6,000 - I thought that was too much. I would be more in line with a with a \$3,000 raise than the \$6,000 raise because 20 years, it's a long time without not getting anything and who knows where it's going to go after in two years from now again so that's my stance and thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you and Bob, thank you for your assistance with forming the Salary Review Commission that not everyone understands how hard you worked and how much help you were in putting that together so thank you.

Legislator Parker: Point of information, what is the actual increase for the Legislators according to this local law?

Legislator Gustafson: (*Inaudible*) commission report that came out on December 5th, its \$5,732.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you, Jamie. Any other comments or discussion on local law introductory 12-24? Seeing none, would the clerk please call the roll?

Legislator Bankoski: If I wanted to make a motion to amend that amount, would I do that at this time?

Chairman Chagnon: Yes you would.

MOVED by Legislator Bankoski, SECONDED by Legislator Niebel to amend the Legislative increase to \$3,000.

Chairman Chagnon: Okay, we have a motion to amend local law 12-24 to change the increased amount to \$3,000 per year which would raise the Legislator salary from \$9,000 to \$12,000 per year. Discussion on them motion to amend local law 12-24?

Legislator Vanstrom: I'm not going to split hairs. The Salary Review Commission came up with a recommendation. We could all come up with 10 different ideas and come back anytime and talk about them in this way or that way or some detailed way. The Salary Review Commission already looked at the whole picture and compromised on these numbers so I'm not going to disrespect they're bipartisan, unbiased, unwavering - they've nothing to gain by coming up with the results they came up with as Mr. Beach eloquently expressed. We're still under the current of what is fair and just in other counties so I'm not going to play games with numbers that a sanctioned group brought back to us, I think that's an insult and I think they took a long time to

come up with the numbers they came up with. They weren't fabricated, they didn't come out of thin air and they were not emotional so that's my sentiment, thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments on the motion to amend? Seeing none, would the clerk please call the roll on the motion to amend local law introductory 12-24?

MOTION to AMEND Local Law Introductory 12-24 - R/C Vote: 5 YES; 14 NO (Anthony, Gustafson, Harmon, Heiser, Johnson, Landy, Nelson, Pavlock, Penhollow, Proctor, Scudder, Vanstrom, Wilfong, Chagnon) – Motion to Amend FAILS

Chairman Chagnon: Okay, then we're back to local law introductory 12-24 as presented. I didn't believe we saw any further comments forth coming, are there any at this point? If not, would the clerk please call the roll?

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 12-24 – R/C Vote: 12 YES; 7 NO (Bankoski, Buchanan, Larson, Nelson, Parker, Penhollow, Scudder) – ADOPTED

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 13-24 – A Local Law Amending the Chautauqua County Charter (Amending Section 4.07)

Chairman Chagnon: Are there any comments or any discussion on local law introductory 13-24? Seeing none, would the clerk please call the roll?

LOCAL LAW INTRO. 13-24 – R/C Vote: 17 YES; 2 NO (Nelson, Scudder) – ADOPTED

RENEW & AMEND RES. NO. 310-23 – Amend Capital Project Accounts—Jamestown Community College

Chairman Chagnon: OK, we now have on our agenda a proposal to Renew and Amend Resolution Number 310- 23 to Amend Capital Project Accounts for the Jamestown Community College. Do I have a motion to renew this resolution?

MOVED by Legislator Wilfong, SECONDED by Legislator Bankoski to Renew Resolution 310-23 – Unanimously Carried to Renew

Chairman Chagnon: Now, I will be looking for a motion to Amend Resolution 310-23

MOVED by Legislator Bankoski, SECONDED by Legislator Wilfong to Amend Resolution 310-23 in the accounts shown below by strikethrough and new text shown in bold – Unanimously Carried to Amend

**CHAUTAUQUA COUNTY
RESOLUTION NO. 310-23**

TITLE: Amend Capital Project Accounts—Jamestown Community

BY: College Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees:

AT THE REQUEST OF: County Executive Paul M. Wendel, Jr.:

WHEREAS, in previous budgets, Chautauqua County approved a number of capital projects for Jamestown Community College; and

WHEREAS, some projects will not utilize their full project funding while the funding needs for other projects exceed original estimates and an increase of funding is needed for outstanding invoices; now therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Director of Finance is authorized and directed to make the following amendments to the 2023 Capital Budgets:

DECREASE CAPITAL APPROPRIATION ACCOUNTS:

H.2490.00005.4	Contractual-Community College Tuition- IT Security (2020)	\$30,000 <u>\$39,481</u>
H.2490.00011.4	Contractual-Community College Tuition- Infrastructure Repairs (2021)	\$48,231 <u>\$38,750</u>
		Total: \$78,231

DECREASE REVENUE ACCOUNTS:

H.2490.00005.R503.1000	Interfund Transfers-Interfund Transfer	\$30,000 <u>\$39,481</u>
H.2490.00011.R503.1000	Interfund Transfers-Interfund Transfer	\$48,231 <u>\$38,750</u>
		Total: \$78,231

INCREASE CAPITAL APPROPRIATION ACCOUNTS:

H.2490.00002.4	Contractual-Community College Tuition-Roofs (2020)	\$52,500
H.2490.00012.4	Contractual-Community College Tuition-Ext Reno/ Underground Heat	<u>\$25,731</u>
		Total: \$78,231

INCREASE CAPITAL REVENUE ACCOUNTS:

H.2490.00002.R503.1000	Interfund Transfers-Interfund Transfer	
H.2490.00012.R503.1000	Interfund Transfers-Interfund Transfer	\$52,500
		<u>\$25,731</u>
		Total: \$78,231

Chairman Chagnon: It is renewed and amended. Now, discussion on the renewed and amended resolution? Any discussion? Seeing none, all those in favor of the renewed and amended resolutions, please say aye.

RENEW & AMEND RES. NO. 310-23 – Amend Capital Project Accounts—Jamestown Community College – Unanimously Carried as Amended

RESOLUTIONS:

34-24 Confirm Reappointments – Chautauqua County Fire Advisory Board, by Public Safety Committee – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

35-24 Confirm Appointments – Chautauqua County Board of Health, by Human Services Committee – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

36-24 Confirm Appointment – Southern Tier West Regional Planning & Development Board, by Planning and Economic Development Committee – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

MOVED by Legislator Bankoski, SECONDED by Legislator Wilfong to block resolutions 37-24 through 57-24 – Unanimously Carried to block

37-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – South & Center Chautauqua Lake Sewer Districts, by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

38-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Portland Pomfret Dunkirk Sewer District, by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

39-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Environment – Landfill, by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

40-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Public Facilities – A Fund, by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

41-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Public Facilities – D Fund, by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

42-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – County Clerk, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

43-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Unified Courts, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

44-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Legislature, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

45-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Health Insurance Fund, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

46-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Energy Fund, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

47-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Insurance Liability (CS Fund), by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

48-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Finance, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

49-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Miscellaneous, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

50-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Human Resources, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

51-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – County Attorney, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

52-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Probation, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

53-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Office of the Sheriff, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

54-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Emergency Services, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

55-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Veterans Service Agency, by Human Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

56-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Public Health, by Human Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

57-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Department of Mental Hygiene and Social Services, by Human Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

Chairman Chagnon: So are there any questions or comments on any of the blocked resolutions, 37-24 through 57-24?

Legislator Pavlock: My comment is really in association with all the year-end reconciliation resolutions here. I just want to comment, I applaud the work of the Departments. Most of these year on reconciliations are budget neutral meaning they were able to find money within their budgets to offset the overages. Whenever you're counting at budget season, you want it to be correct but sometimes things change so you know, being able to do it within your account is good, it means that departments were fiscally responsible and were able to locate some savings. Sometimes it meant a vacancy, which isn't a good thing. I want to promote that the County is actively trying to hire in a lot of positions and I would just assume that we fill those positions in these year-end reconciliations wouldn't be so budget neutral. It might help alleviate some of the workload that our current employees face but nonetheless I do appreciate the work of our staff to be as concise with their spending as possible so we can be budget neutral.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments or questions on any of the blocked resolutions? Hearing none, all those in favor of resolutions 37-24 through 57-24 please say "aye" Opposed? The blocked resolutions are carried.

58-24 Amend 2023 Budget to Increase Funding for the District Attorney Office Expansion Project within the Chautauqua County American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) Spending Plan, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

59-24 Amend 2023 Budget for Year End Reconciliations – Department of Planning & Development, by Planning and Economic Development and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

60-24 Amend Spending Plan and 2023 Budget for Chautauqua County Projects funded by the American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) , by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

61-24 Amend 2024 Budget to Implement the Women's Shelter Project within the Chautauqua County American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) Spending Plan, by Human Services and Audit & Control Committees

Chairman Chagnon: Are there any comments or questions?

Legislator Parker: I just wanted to issue a statement of support for the ARPA committee allocating money for the women's shelter project that is a much needed project with our increase in homelessness in Chautauqua County and I think that this is a really good use of our money. Thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments or questions on the resolution? Hearing none, all of those in favor please say "aye". Opposed? Carried.

RES. NO. 61-24 – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

- 62-24 Amend 2024 Budget to Implement Lake Erie Sediment Assessments**, by Planning and Economic Development and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED
- 63-24 Amend 2024 Budget to Implement Walnut Creek Stabilization**, by Planning and Economic Development and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED
- 64-24 Amend 2024 Budget to Complete Chautauqua Lake Marina, LLC Project**, by Planning and Economic Development and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED
- 65-24 Modification of Membership of Portland-Pomfret-Dunkirk Sewer District Board** – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED
- 66-24 Modified Quorum for North Chautauqua County Water District Board in the Event of a Conflict of Interest**, by Public Facilities Committee – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED
- 67-24 Authorize Agreements with Towns, Cities and Villages for Snow Removal and Ice Control**, by Public Facilities Committee – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED
- 68-24 Authorize Agreement for Use of Space for Civil Service Examinations**, by Public Facilities Committee – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED
- 69-24 Authorize Agreement for Advance Payment for NYSDOT Bridge Project**, by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED
- 70-24 Establishing Naming Policy for County-funded Industrial and Business Parks**, by Administrative Services Committee

Chairman Chagnon: Any comments or questions on the resolution?

Legislator Wilfong: Mr. Chairman, could I have that resolution read aloud?

Chairman Chagnon: You may. One moment while the Clerk finds that.

Clerk Lee:

“RES. NO. 70-24

Establishing Naming Policy for County-funded Industrial and Business Parks

By Administrative Services Committee:

At the Request of County Executive Paul M. Wendel, Jr.:

WHEREAS, residents of Chautauqua County have a long history of service in the Armed Forces of the United States; and

WHEREAS, the Chautauqua County Legislature finds it imperative to remember the heroism and sacrifice of our veterans who have fallen in the line of duty; and

WHEREAS, the County pursues an economic development strategy that includes finding, funding and developing industrial and business parks to attract private enterprise; therefore be it

RESOLVED, The County Legislature establishes a policy of naming such economic development areas for fallen members of the Armed Forces, with a primary emphasis on recognizing and memorializing those who were Chautauqua County residents, enlisted or noncommissioned officers, and who died in combat.

Signed: Scudder, Vanstrom, Anthony, Heiser”

Legislator Wilfong: I would just like to thank Patrick Slagle and the County Executive for hearing me out on this venture. I certainly appreciate it as I'm sure all of the veterans in Chautauqua County do. Thank you very much.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments or discussion on the resolution?

Legislator Larson: I'm more concerned about opening up industrial and commercial parks in Chautauqua County and worrying about naming them later. Naming anything for anyone who gives their life for the service of their country is a fine idea so I will vote for it, but what is the logic- Sheriff Quattrone is here this evening and God forbid one of his deputies is killed in the line of duty, we can't name a 60 acre industrial park after our own sheriff's deputy killed in the line of duty. God forbid a department of public facilities worker is killed in the line of serving our county and this resolution would be excluded from naming anything from an industrial park, commercial park or part of it after a county worker who was killed maybe even working on the project. I appreciate recognizing veterans. My father was a World War II veteran in Europe. My father in law was a World War II medic in Europe. Other than the fact that veterans vote, I'm not fully sure why this resolution excluded a county sheriff's deputy dying in the line of duty and having that name put on a county project. I'll vote for this but the logic of it, excluding all of the other possible folks that die in our service, escapes me. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Chairman Chagnon: Any other comments?

Legislator Harmon: I just have a question. I have a seat on the IDA Board. I guess my question would be - we are working on some current projects now that don't really have a name and I know that they are moving forward- will this resolution change what we're doing with those going forward? That might be a question for Mr. Geise

Mr. Geise: Yeah, I mean with the Ripley Industrial Park, we've been naming it the Ripley Industrial Park. I suppose it could be problematic. I haven't really thought about it a lot. The fact that Ripley has (*inaudible*) that's what we've been calling it and that's what we've been calling it to the state. It could be – the other thing that—for me is like who decides what that should be? Is there a process that's been established to determine who makes that call about whether it's this

family's child or this person's husband or wife? You know, that's what concerns me and then having hard feelings based on that.

Legislator Harmon Thanks Mark, that's my concern as well.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you

Legislator Wilfong: The intent of this was to actually have the whole community be able to bring someone's name forward that had passed away during active combat operations. So at this particular time, the Village of Ripley, I believe would have that opportunity. And to address the thing about a worker that would meet a tragic accident here whether it be a sheriff or it would be a worker – a soldier leads a different life. A soldier is sent different places. Those workers probably live nearby. They probably have their family, where soldiers are sent all over the world and sometimes to hostile environments for sure. That was the basis of the resolution – is to make sure that those people were recognized wherever they fell in this country or a foreign country. Thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments on the resolution? Hearing none. All those in favor please say "aye". Opposed? Resolution is carried.

RES. NO. 70-24 – ADOPTED with Legislator Harmon voting "No"

71-24 Amend Senior Real Property Tax Exemption, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

72-24 Authorize Acceptance of Criminal Justice Discovery and Bail Reform Funding, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

73-24 Authorize Execution of Northern Chautauqua Community Foundation Impact Grant, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

74-24 Purchase of 2002 Ford Ambulance from Kiantone Independent Fire Department, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

75-24 Authorize Lease Agreement with the Village of Mayville, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees

Chairman Chagnon: Any comments on the resolution?

Legislator Proctor: I just want to commend Sheriff Quattrone and the Mayville Village Mayor Rick Syper on coming to an agreement. This has been a problem in Mayville for a long time and I think the Sheriff's plan is a good one and I hope it works. I also want to commend him

for his efforts in decreasing the recidivism of prisoners coming back and all of his efforts in that regard.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Well said. Any other comments or discussion on the resolution? Hearing none. All those in favor please say “aye”. Opposed? Carried.

RES. NO. 75-24 – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

76-24 Authorize Execution of NYS Office of Homeland Security Statewide Interoperable Communications Grant (SICG) Program FY23, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

77-24 Authorize Execution of NYS Office of Homeland Security Public Safety Answering Point (PSAP) Grant FY23, by Public Safety and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

78-24 Authorize Federal and State Aid Applications for the Chautauqua County Dunkirk Airport Five Year Capital Improvement Plan (ACIP) for FY 2024 2028, by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – ADOPTED with Legislator Scudder voting “No”

79-24 SEQRA Determination and Lead Agency Designation for the Obstruction Mitigation and Easement Acquisition Project at Chautauqua County Airport – Jamestown (JHW), by Public Facilities Committee – ADOPTED with Legislator Scudder voting “No”

80-24 Authorize Federal and State Aid Applications for the Chautauqua County Jamestown Airport Five-Year Capital Improvement Plan (ACIP) for FY 2024-2028, by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – ADOPTED with Legislator Scudder voting “No”

81-24 Approve Corrective Action Plan (CAP) for Submission to Office of the State Comptroller (OSC), by Public Facilities and Audit & Control Committees – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

82-24 Authorizing Purchase of CCIDA Bonds, by Planning & Economic Development and Audit & Control Committees

Chairman Chagnon: Any comments on the resolution?

Legislator Johnson: Mr. Chairman, in committee discussions we – in this proposal, there’s an item three where the County Executive is directed to negotiate favorable terms for the county and we received a verbal commitment that the county would receive a mortgage against the property should the repayment not be made and I would like to hear what the county IDA has

to say on that and if from our County Attorney if we need to have that in writing to make it enforceable.

Chairman Chagnon: Mark would you like to address that?

Mr. Geise: Yeah, so it's going to be 146 acres. We would pledge up that land as collateral. I would estimate that it would have a minimum of \$10 million. We will pledge that land up with all the improvements, the road, the water, sewer, etc. in terms of how that works. Rich, would you like to talk on that?

Mr. Dixon: The County would buy the IDA bond, (*inaudible*) would put up the collateral. The mortgage would be taken up by the county. The county would have the mortgage on the property – should there be default on the repayment, which is highly unlikely since it is a reimbursable grant from the state but if we did, the property would then be subject to the mortgage and the county could foreclose, sell it and redeem their money. Pretty simple.

Legislator Johnson: So that language would be in the mortgage? That is not going to cause a problem with some other lender on that project somewhere?

Mr. Dixon: This is the only lender at the time. The rest is grant money, IDA money, county capital project money and ARPA funding and this money again is just a bridge loan to cover the grant from the state. This would only be the only money that's borrowed from the project.

Legislator Johnson: Thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other comments, questions on the resolution? Hearing none, would the clerk please call the roll?

RES. NO. 82-24 – R/C VOTE: 19 YES; 0 NO; – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

83-24 Setting Salary for Law Graduate Trainee, by Administrative Services and Audit & Control Committees

Chairman Chagnon: Any comments or questions on the resolution? Hearing none. Would the clerk please call the role?

RES. NO. 83-24 – R/C VOTE: 19 YES; 0 NO; – UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED

MOTIONS:**A. Proclaiming March Women's History Month**

Clerk Lee: Motion "A" on the agenda, "Proclaiming March Women's History Month" has received the required amount of signatures to be brought to the floor.

Motion "A" Proclaiming March Women's History Month – Unanimously Adopted

B. Proclaiming March 18th-22nd Agricultural Literacy Week in Chautauqua County

Clerk Lee: Motion "B" on the agenda, "Proclaiming March 18th-22nd Agricultural Literacy Week in Chautauqua County" has received the required amount of signatures to be brought to the floor.

Motion "B" Proclaiming March 18th-22nd Agricultural Literacy Week in Chautauqua County – Unanimously Adopted

C. Urging Action by New York State Legislators to Advance on Behalf of SUNY Community Colleges to Increase Funding to Community Colleges in the State Budget

Clerk Lee: Motion "C" on the agenda, "Urging Action by New York State Legislators to Advance on Behalf of SUNY Community Colleges to Increase Funding to Community College in the State Budget" has received the required amount of signatures to be brought to the floor.

Motion "C" Urging Action by New York State Legislators to Advance on Behalf of SUNY Community Colleges to Increase Funding to Community College in the State Budget – Unanimously Adopted

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chairman Chagnon: That brings us to announcements and I'm going to start off with the first one that the legislators have probably found a bracelet on the desk this is in support of under Sheriff Telford. Any other announcements for the good of the order? Any other announcements? Hearing none. We will move to the second privilege of the floor.

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR

Members of the public may comment on any subject.
A member of the legislature may speak on any subject.
Individual comments are limited to 3 minutes and

comments representing a group shall be limited to 5 minutes.

I'm Roger Harrower from 321 Palmer Street in Jamestown New York. I have a statement for you. In 1 Timothy 2 1-4 we are told first of all "then I urge that supplication prayers intercessions and thanksgivings be made for all people for kings and all who are in high positions that we may lead a peaceful and quiet life Godly and dignified in every way this is good and is pleasing in the sight of God our savior who desires all people to be saved and come to the knowledge of the truth". You are some of these high positions and have significant influence on the moral culture of our people. Without an unchangeable moral culture, I believe we will not continue to exist as a nation that code is set by the leadership which is you. At Lakewood Baptist Church, we've taken this call to prayer seriously and placed the names of elected officials on cards for whom we have information (some of you are very camera shy by the way) on cards so that our people can be reminded to pray for you. We are praying for your integrity, honesty and wisdom. If you wish to be added to our prayer effort I can give you some contact information. Thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Anyone else wishing to address the second privilege of the floor?

Doug Champ 225 Bowling Street. Being its literary week, I'm going to read something and I'm hopeful that you all would know where it's come from but it's very relevant because I'm going to add on to that a little bit on the situation that was talked about in the paper recently by a legislator and it's important that people comment. "It was the best of times. It was the worst of times. It was the age of wisdom. It was the age of foolishness. It was the (*inaudible*) of belief. It was the (*inaudible*) of criticality. It was the season of light. It was a season of darkness. It was a spirit of hope. It was a winter of despair. We had everything before us. We had nothing before us. We were all going directly to heaven. We were all going directly the other way. In short the period was so far like the present period that some of the noisiest authorities insisted on it being received for good or for evil in the (*inaudible*) of degree of comparison only. You all should know where that came from Charles Dickens, A Tale of 2 cities-1858. What I'm upset about is this article that Fred Larson put in the paper about where is the bottom. Where is the bottom? I can't believe that we have this communication in the paper coming from a County Legislature. We're not in the bottom. This County is trying to rise. I really believe the leadership that we've had has created an opportunity for us. What really irritated me -- I'm a veteran. I'm a veteran who has seen a lot of stuff. My whole family were veterans so I can't understand why there's a problem with places being named after fallen heroes. In addition to that, legislator Larson references cancer as being equivalent to economic decline. Okay, why is that such an analogy? My wife died of cancer when she was 42. I go on a pilgrimage every three months to Roswell. Agent Orange affected a lot of guys that I was with so how can we equate that being economically a viable point of decline? In addition, the last Republican Governor was in 2006, so the County and the State are combined with an analysis on where we gone in this County and this State. I believe that what we've had is abandonment of Western New York. You can site metrics, you can site places that have failed but a communication from a legislator about where is the bottom doesn't do us any good at all.

Chairman Chagnon: Doug you've exceeded your three minutes.

Mr. Champ: So I guess I asked all you legislators do you think we've reached the bottom line?

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Anyone else?

Hi I'm Nicole Kretz. I work for child protection and all this talk about money I see it fitting to speak on behalf of the division of child protection. New York State says a manageable case load is about 15 cases per CPS worker. Many of our staff have caseloads in the high teens, even the 20s. Presently I'm a 35 an hour week employee so we've been asking for 40-hour work week for over a year. It never seems to be something the budget can allow. Many times our staff are working 40 hours and can't get caught up due to low staffing and high vacancies, inability to retain workers, the amount of cases per worker and the high needs for the families we work with. Although many of us work the 40 hours, we don't get the accruals that go with it so we're not afforded the compensatory vacation or sick time that goes along with it so please remember this when we present a request for a grade reallocation in the near future and advocate for our commissioner to immediately put in a 40-hour work week for our workers our work directly affects the safety of children and families within our community. Thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you and thank you for what you do next.

Jim Quattrone, Sheriff: Sheriff Quattrone, Chautauqua County Sheriff Jamestown, New York. So I think I have 20 minutes because I have four topics. First of all I would like to thank the legislature for volunteering each one of you 19 to go read during agricultural literacy week.

Chairman Chagnon: I'm signed up

Sheriff Quattrone. All right perfect, I think you would enjoy it. I just wanted to say that. But in reality, I also want to thank legislator Proctor for bringing up the lease with Mayville and that's going to be used for a re-entry Hub but thank the village and the residents of the village who came out in force at our first meeting and shared some of their concerns and then the mayor was willing to work with us to make sure we have that. The raise, there was a little bit of discussion on that. I thank the commission for doing that quite honestly I never really track how much I make, I have a wonderful wife who is a great budget person and I rely on budget people. She tells me how much I'm allowed to spend. She has made it possible so I don't have to necessarily worry about what my salary is. I don't know if I really want to thank you for voting that in because technically I'm not getting a raise other than I mean it is the CPI, I had to look at what that was. I do get the CPI and I'm appreciative of that but this raise is for the next Sheriff coming in. I don't know yet if I'm going to be running for Sheriff. Not saying I'm not going to but I want to say that it's for the next one coming in. What's important to know is there's seven Police agencies other than the sheriff's office in Chautauqua County. That's including the State Police. There's two that are paid a little less than the Sheriff. The other five make considerably more

than what the Sheriff makes. Again that's not a complaint, as Mr. Larson has mentioned I knew what I was -- well I kind of knew what I was making when I came into office so I'm not going to complain about that. Hopefully what this will do is bring qualified candidates into the position or to run for the office and we want to continue to do that. Lastly, there was some -- the Post Journal did run an article on my trip to the Border. I spent a couple days down in Arizona last week to visit the border to see firsthand. I've heard for many years the issues at the border based on Fox News, CNN and whatever other news that has whatever slant that they're going to put on that and I felt that it was important for me to go down and see because we do have people crossing our northern border. We have had arrest made in Chautauqua County as a result of people crossing the northern border. These aren't the people -- when we think about the people crossing the border, not everyone is a criminal. I'm talking about the criminals that're crossing the border. There's many people who are crossing the border according to what the policies are and we can't hold that against them but my concern is those who are crossing with bad intentions that are --it's not the drug smuggling that we're concerned with, it's the people smuggling and seeing lives that are lost so I just, you know, wanted to share. I'm more than happy and I'm still kind of compiling all my thoughts. I brought a camera with so I could document it visually and I was taking too many notes. I kind of forgot to take pictures. I got a few pictures but not a lot but I'd be more than happy to talk to the legislative body to share, you know, some of the information that we gathered. Sheriff (*inaudible*), who's the Sheriff in (*inaudible*) County, he has been dealing with this for his whole career and we had the opportunity to not only talk with his officers but to talk with residents of the County at several Town Hall meetings to get their take on it. Unfortunately, we didn't talk to any border patrol officers because there were none to be seen in a 30 to 40 mile stretch of the highway that we were on because they were tied up processing individuals who were crossing the border instead of being on the border itself. So just wanted to share that because I know there were some people who were concerned about me making that visit so thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you and you didn't go 20 minutes, but thank you. Anyone else wishing to address the second privilege of the floor?

Legislator Wilfong: Thank you Mr. Chairman I'd like to take a moment to discuss a newspaper clipping from the Post Journal that was given to me by constituents in reference to the proposed pay increases for the elected officials that was debated here tonight. In the clipping reference was made to the makeup of the salary commission between the Democratic Party and the Republican Party. The commission was made up of volunteers who were asked to serve and to try to provide this legislature with some guidelines and how to proceed going forward with these delicate proceedings. My exception with this paper calling out individuals that have pensions for Chautauqua County. I don't believe the Post Journal has the right to bring someone's personal matters into the newspaper because the Post Journal feels their experiences would impact their views for salary increases for elected officials which is against the viewpoint of the Post Journal. What does it matter where people work in their past life? If they work for the County, they deserve their pensions. These commission members are volunteers and they should be treated with the same dignity and respect anyone would be when they sacrifice their time volunteering for their community. I believe that once again, the Post Journal has overstepped its

authority and this body needs to find another way to put information out to the public. We have WRFA, WJTN and many other online news providers that would be a good place to start. Thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you.

Legislator Larson: Mr. Chairman, 40 years ago I was an adjunct faculty at JCC and I had a very bright young man in a law course I taught and his name was Jim Quattrone and I want to commend him as Sheriff, and how innovative he has been in many ways and when my time as City Drug Court Judge, I may have said this to you before but the work of folks at the jail with people with the chemical dependency, alcoholism, whatever is terrific and to be perfectly clear whatever-- If Sheriff Quattrone runs for reelection and wins whatever the salary is that particular year, or two or three or four year term, I know he will have earned it and deserves it and I commend him. I wish all of my students had turned out as successful as Jim Quattrone but it's kind of fun to have known him since he was a teenager. Thank you.

Chairman Chagnon: Thank you. Any other privilege of the floor? Hearing none, I'm looking for a motion.

MOVED by Legislator Bankoski, SECONDED by Legislator Gustafson to adjourn.

Unanimously Carried (8:17 p.m.)

Respectfully submitted and transcribed,
Olivia Lee, Clerk of the Legislature & Kristi Zink, Deputy Clerk